

TITLE: U.S. comments on SGFS N1301, SGFS Standing Document SD-1.

SOURCE: ANSI

STATUS: For consideration at the 12th ISO/IEC JTC1/SGFS Plenary Meeting, June 17th - 21st, 1996, Tokyo, Japan.

The U.S. has reviewed the current SD-1 as documented in ISO/IEC JTC1/SGFS N1301, the JTC1 Guidelines on the use of Reference Specifications in ISPs (JTC1 N4047, SGFS N1341) and the SGFS comments on RS (SGFS N1309). Based on this review, the U.S. provides the following comments on SD-1:

1. CLAUSE 1, SCOPE, SENTENCE PRIOR TO EDITOR'S NOTE: This document is intended to be the place in which the processing of profiles within the scope of JTC1 is documented. At this time, the document covers OSE profiles, but if the need to address other profiles within JTC1 is identified, this document would address that process. Therefore, this sentence should state: "These procedures currently cover OSE profiles (including OSI profiles) and associated Profile Test Suites (PTS)."
(Note: "currently" is added and an editorial correction to insert a space after the ")" has been included.)
2. CLAUSE 3.2, SECOND SENTENCE AND ACCOMPANYING NOTE: The processing of ISPs will occur between JTC1 and other TCs. The developing organization will work through the committee with which it plans to submit profiles. Therefore, it is not necessary to burden the process by requiring that JTC1, the TC and the submitting organization all sign the cooperative agreement. As is currently the practice and as is shown in Annex B, it is sufficient for JTC1 and the other TC to sign. Therefore, this second sentence should be changed to read: "In the case of multiple TC involvement, a cooperative agreement shall be developed and agreed jointly by JTC1 and the TC(s) involved." Upon resolution of this point, the accompanying Note can be removed.
3. CLAUSE 5.1, 2ND PARAGRAPH: With the approval of JTC1 N4047, the changes agreed in SGFS N 1309 should now be included. Item 4.1.3 of SGFS N1309 can be addressed by adding the following sentence at the end of Clause 5.1, 2nd paragraph: "In the case of PDISPs containing RS, PDISP submitters should notify the SGFS at least six months prior to the planned submission, identifying the PAS to be referenced. This additional time is needed to enable SGFS and NBs to identify relevant expertise to provide support for the review and ballot process (or for NBs to take part in the development process if they wish)."
4. CLAUSE 5.2, ITEM b): With the approval of JTC1 N4047, the changes agreed in SGFS N 1309 should now be included. Items 4.1.1 and 4.1.2 of SGFS N1309 can be addressed as follows:
 - 1) change the title of item b) to "Normative References";
 - 2) A new point should be added between current points 2) and 3) stating: "In the case where a Reference Specification is included, the ISP developing organization must provide corroborative evidence of the validity and technical consistency of references

to the PAS as part of the Explanatory Report.";

- 3) A NOTE should be added following the newly added point above, stating: "ISP developing organizations are reminded that the use of the PAS Transposition process, followed by a reference to the resulting IS, is the preferred method for handling references to publicly available specifications."

5 CLAUSE 5.2, ITEM b), POINT 2), EDITOR'S NOTE: This note can be removed.

6 CLAUSE 5.2, ITEM f), POINT 2): With the approval of JTC1 N4047, the changes agreed in SGFS N 1309 should now be included. Item 4.1.6 of SGFS N1309 can be partially addressed by adding a Note at the end of this point stating: "Note: In the case of PDISP containing RS, the potential for the use of regional material requires that special emphasis be placed on the extent of international harmonization achieved."

7 CLAUSE 5.2, ITEM f), POINT 4): Based on JTC1 process changes, the text "(e.g., for PAS Transposition)" should be added following "submitted to the base standards committees".

8 CLAUSE 5.2, ITEM f), POINT 4), EDITOR'S NOTE: This note can be removed.

9 CLAUSE 5.2, NEW ITEM: With the approval of JTC1 N4047, the changes agreed in SGFS N 1309 should now be included. Item 4.1.4 of SGFS N1309 can be addressed by adding a new item to Clause 5.2. The item could be added between the current items b) and c) or between g) and h). The item should state:

"x) Reference Reports. In the case in which RS are included, the Reference Reports for the PAS concerned must be provided in the form identified by JTC 1 in JTC1 N 4047, 'The Normative Referencing of Specifications other than International Standards in International Standardized Profiles - Guidelines for ISP Submitters'."

10 CLAUSE 6.1, LAST PARAGRAPH: With the approval of JTC1 N4047, the changes agreed in SGFS N 1309 should now be included. Item 4.1.5 of SGFS N1309 can be addressed by adding a Note following the current last paragraph of 6.1, stating: "In the case of a PDISP containing RS, a review will be conducted on the PDISP."

11 CLAUSE 6.2, PARAGRAPH 2: With the approval of JTC1 N4047, the changes agreed in SGFS N 1309 should now be included. Item 4.1.7 of SGFS N1309 can be addressed by adding a new paragraph following the current paragraph 2 stating: "In the case of a PDISP containing RS, the ISP developing organization should identify experts familiar with the PAS to be added to the SGFS review list."

12 CLAUSE 6.3, ITEMS e) AND f): With the approval of JTC1 N4047, items e) and f) can be replaced as follows: "If Publicly Available Specifications are referenced in the PDISP, assess as to whether the JTC1 Guidelines in JTC1 N 4047 have been followed."

13 CLAUSE 6.3, ITEM k), EDITOR'S NOTE: This note can be removed.

14 CLAUSE 6.4, ITEM f), EDITOR'S NOTE: This note can be removed.

15 CLAUSE 7.2: With the approval of JTC1 N4047, the changes agreed in SGFS N 1309 should now be included. Item 4.1.9 of SGFS N1309 can be addressed by adding a new paragraph between the current 1st and 2nd paragraphs of Clause 7.2 as follows: "In case b) above, the DISP cannot be considered as approved, even though other criteria for approval are met (i.e. sufficient YES votes, not too many NO votes).

It is the responsibility of the ballot resolution meeting to establish (by consensus) the status of the DISP (approved or not approved). Ballot resolution will be allowed to occur via electronic mail or teleconference to ensure that NB concerns are addressed even when they are not able to attend the ballot resolution meeting."

16 CLAUSE 8.2, PARAGRAPH 2: With the approval of JTC1 N4047, the changes agreed in SGFS N 1309 should now be included. Item 4.1.8 of SGFS N1309 can be addressed by adding the following sentence after the current 1st sentence of paragraph 2: "An amended version of theISP should also be submitted if a referenced PAS is transposed to an IS."

17 ANNEX A, ITEMS 10 AND 11: With the approval of JTC1 N4047, items 10 and 11 can be replaced as follows: "If Publicly Available Specifications are referenced in the PDISP, assess as to whether the JTC1 Guidelines in JTC1 N 4047 have been followed."