

Title: Disposition of Comments Received on the ballot of DTR 10000-1
Source: TR 10000-1 editor
Date: June 20, 1995
Status: Output of the Ballot Resolution Meeting.

Document JTC 1 N 3559 contains the summary of Voting on Document JTC 1 N 3382, DTR 10000-1: Information Technology - Framework and Taxonomy of International Standardized Profiles - Part 1: General Principles and Document Framework.

Result of the voting: 21 votes of approval, 2 votes of approval with comments (from Canada and the USA) and 1 vote of disapproval (from the United Kingdom).

Comments from Canada

Comment from Canada reads: "We note that JTC 1 SGFS N 1254 is an issues list for the future development of TR 10000. Any comments submitted on this JTC 1 ballot should be considered together with the issues raised in SGFS N 1254." This comment applies to the ballot on all parts of TR 10000. There is however no recommended replacement text.

Comments from the United Kingdom

UK 2 If UK comment on UK 3 on DTR 10000-3 is accepted, replace paragraph 4 of Clause 1 by:

"ISO/IEC TR 10000-3 provides the context for functional standardization in support of Open System Environments (OSE), and principles and a classification scheme for OSE profiles which may be or have been submitted for ratification as International Standardized Profiles. It outlines the basic OSE objectives and defines the concept of OSE profiles and, along with this part of ISO/IEC TR 10000, gives guidance to organizations making proposals for Draft ISPs on the nature and content of the documents they produce."

Disposition:

Comment on UK 3 on TR 10000-3 was approved with modifications. The same modifications are applied to the above replacement text:

"ISO/IEC TR 10000-3 provides the context for functional standardization in support of Open System Environments (OSE), and principles and a classification scheme for OSE profiles which may be or have been submitted for ratification as International Standardized Profiles. It outlines the basic OSE objectives and concepts, and defines an approach and format for OSE profiles specified by International Standardized Profiles and, along with this part of ISO/IEC TR 10000, gives guidance to organizations making proposals for Draft ISPs on the nature and content of the documents they produce."

UK 3 Move existing text of Clause 6.2 (with modifications) to Part 2 as Clause 7.

Replace the existing text in Clause 6.2 by:

"The application of base standards may involve reference to specifications that are subject to registration procedures (for example, for abstract syntaxes). Profiles that reference such base standards must define the use of such specifications (i.e. indicate whether they are included in the specification or not).

Where such a specification is already registered, the profile specification shall refer to it using its registered name. Where the registered specification allows, the profile specification may define particular parameter values.

Where such a specification is not already registered, then action must be taken to register it according to the procedures defined by the base standard itself or by an associated registration procedure standard, in accordance with the general registration requirements of Annex H of the ISO/IEC JTC 1 Directives."

Disposition:

The comment was rejected: it was felt that the reference to ISO/IEC 9834-1 was generic enough to appear in part 1. However, the proposed replacement text was used to make the existing text even more general.

Comments from the US

US 1 Relocate 3.1.3 within clause 3.2

Disposition: accepted

US 2 In clause 5, page 3, left column, bottom paragraph: change 'Functional Standardization' to lower case (twice); replace 'common' with 'consistent' (twice).

Disposition: accepted

US 3 In clause 5, page 3, right column, paragraph after the Note: delete the quotes around the word 'legitimize'.

Disposition: accepted

US 4 Clauses 6.4 and 6.5: some of the text contained herein is lacking clarity.

Disposition: accepted in principle.

Clause 6.5 is rewritten based on the provided guidance. As no guidance for clause 6.4 was given, this clause is not changed.

US 5 Clause 8.2, page 9, right column, 2nd paragraph after the bullet: delete 'or reduction of the content of a part to a small amount of text,'.

Disposition: accepted.