Mandating Annex D
Require No More

Document #: P2874R1
Date: 2023-06-12
Project: Programming Language C++
Audience: LWG
Reply-to: Alisdair Meredith
<ameredith1@bloomberg.net>

Contents

1 Abstract 1

2 Revision history. 1
  2.1 R1: June 2023 (Varna meeting) 1
  2.2 R0: 2023 May (pre-Varna mailing) 1

3 Introduction 2

4 History 2

5 Analysis 2

6 Proposed wording 2
  6.1 Wording Intent 2
  6.2 Proposed Changes 3

7 Acknowledgements 11

8 References 11

1 Abstract

Annex D of the C++ Standard, deprecated features, retains pre-C++ 20 wording style for several library clauses. This paper updates that wording to our current standards.

2 Revision history.

2.1 R1: June 2023 (Varna meeting)
— Updated wording, based on [N4950]

2.2 R0: 2023 May (pre-Varna mailing)
Initial draft of this paper, based on [P2139R2].
Notable changes since [P2139R2]
— Updated wording, based on [N4928]
3 Introduction

At the start of the C++23 cycle, [P2139R2] tried to review each deprecated feature of C++ to see which we would benefit from actively removing and which might now be better undeprecated. Consolidating all this analysis into one place was intended to ease the (L)EWG review process but in return gave the author so much feedback that the next revision of the paper was not completed.

For the C++26 cycle, a much shorter paper, [P2863R0], will track the overall analysis, but for features that the author wants to actively progress, a distinct paper will decouple progress from the larger paper so that the delays on a single feature do not hold up progress on all.

This paper takes up the deprecated Requires clause wording style retained by D.11 [depr.res.on.required].

4 History

The deprecated Requires clause wording had been replaced by the use of three new paragraph types: Constraints, Mandates, and Preconditions. The guidelines on when to use each of these new elements was proved by Walter Brown in [P0788R3] (which uses Expects rather than Preconditions).

A long sequence of papers by Marshall Clow provided the necessary analysis and detail to update each standard library clause. However, given priorities competing for library time, it was not deemed a good use of LWG time to complete the process for the deprecated features in Annex D, and the Editors moved the specification for Requires elements into Annex D, rather than striking it entirely, to provide consistency in the standard itself.

As features continue to be deprecated in subsequent standards, Annex D is filling up with new additions that are indeed specified in the modern style. Rather than wait indefinitely for the deprecated features with legacy wording to all be removed, this paper proposes making the final library wording updates and removing the Requires: element now.

5 Analysis

The Constraints element is used to signify a condition that should exclude an overload from name look-up rather than cause an immediate error (the SFINAE principle) and none of the wording remaining in Annex D needs this term.

The Mandates element requires the compilation produce a diagnosable error when violated by the caller. This restriction is enforced at compiler-time. Typically, when a specification has a Requires clause with type constraints, it is rewritten as a Mandates.

The Preconditions element specified run-time requirements on callers, typically on the values of provided arguments or object state.

meets the requirements
shall (not) be - > is (not)

6 Proposed wording

All changes are relative to [N4944].

6.1 Wording Intent

By observing whether a given Requires element applies to compile-time or run-time entities, we turn the Requires element into a Mandates or a Preconditions element.
Just the deprecated clauses that feature \textit{Requires} elements are presented. A proper review of this wording should audit that there are no remaining uses elsewhere in Annex D, or the standard at large, to verify that the author’s due diligence is correct.

6.2 Proposed Changes

D.11 \textbf{[depr.res.on.required] Requires paragraph}

1 In addition to the elements specified in 16.3.2.4 \textit{[structure.specifications]}, descriptions of function semantics may also contain a \textit{Requires} element to denote the preconditions for calling a function.

2 Violation of any preconditions specified in a function’s \textit{Requires} element results in undefined behavior unless the function’s \textit{Threws} element specifies throwing an exception when the precondition is violated.

D.14 \textbf{[depr.relops] Relational operators}

1 The header <\texttt{utility}> (22.2.1 \textit{[utility.syn]}) has the following additions:

   \begin{verbatim}
   namespace std::rel_ops {
     template<class T> bool operator!=(const T&, const T&);
     template<class T> bool operator>(const T&, const T&);
     template<class T> bool operator<=(const T&, const T&);
     template<class T> bool operator>=(const T&, const T&);
   }
   \end{verbatim}

2 To avoid redundant definitions of \texttt{operator!=} out of \texttt{operator==} and operators \texttt{>, <, and >=} out of \texttt{operator<}, the library provides the following:

   template<class T> bool operator!=(const T& x, const T& y);

3 \textbf{Requires:} Type \texttt{T} is \textit{Cpp17EqualityComparable} (Table 28).

   \textbf{Preconditions:} \texttt{T} meets the \textit{Cpp17EqualityComparable} requirements (Table 28).

4 \textbf{Returns:} \texttt{!(x == y)}.

   template<class T> bool operator>(const T& x, const T& y);

5 \textbf{Requires:} Type \texttt{T} is \textit{Cpp17LessThanComparable} (Table 29).

   \textbf{Preconditions:} \texttt{T} meets the \textit{Cpp17LessThanComparable} requirements (Table 29).

6 \textbf{Returns:} \texttt{y < x}.

   template<class T> bool operator<=(const T& x, const T& y);

7 \textbf{Requires:} Type \texttt{T} is \textit{Cpp17LessThanComparable} (Table 29).

   \textbf{Preconditions:} \texttt{T} meets the \textit{Cpp17LessThanComparable} requirements (Table 29).

8 \textbf{Returns:} \texttt{!(y < x)}.

   template<class T> bool operator>=(const T& x, const T& y);

9 \textbf{Requires:} Type \texttt{T} is \textit{Cpp17LessThanComparable} (Table 29).

   \textbf{Preconditions:} \texttt{T} meets the \textit{Cpp17LessThanComparable} requirements (Table 29).

10 \textbf{Returns:} \texttt{!(x < y)}.

D.19 \textbf{[depr.meta.types] Deprecated type traits}

1 The header <\texttt{type_traits}> (21.3.3 \textit{[meta.type.synop]}) has the following additions:
namespace std {
    template<class T> struct is_pod;
    template<class T> constexpr bool is_pod_v = is_pod<T>::value;
    template<size_t Len, size_t Align = default_alignment> // see below
        struct aligned_storage;
    template<size_t Len, size_t Align = default_alignment> // see below
        using aligned_storage_t = typename aligned_storage<Len, Align>::type;
    template<size_t Len, class... Types>
        struct aligned_union;
    template<size_t Len, class... Types>
        using aligned_union_t = typename aligned_union<Len, Types...>::type;}

2 The behavior of a program that adds specializations for any of the templates defined in this subclause is undefined, unless explicitly permitted by the specification of the corresponding template.

template<class T> struct is_pod;

A POD class is a class that is both a trivial class and a standard-layout class, and has no non-static data members of type non-POD class (or array thereof). A POD type is a scalar type, a POD class, an array of such a type, or a cv-qualified version of one of these types.

Remarks: is_pod<T> is a Cpp17UnaryTypeTrait (21.3.2 [meta.rqmts]) with a base characteristic of true_type if T is a POD type, and false_type otherwise. A POD class is a class that is both a trivial class and a standard layout class, and has no non-static data members of type non-POD class (or array thereof). A POD type is a scalar type, a POD class, an array of such a type, or a cv qualified version of one of these types.

[Note: It is unspecified whether a closure type (7.5.5.2 [expr.prim.lambda.closure]) is a POD type. —end note]

D.24 [depr.util.smartptr.shared.atomic] Deprecated shared_ptr atomic access

1 The header <memory> (20.2.2 [memory.syn]) has the following additions:

namespace std {
    template <class T>
        bool atomic_is_lock_free(const shared_ptr<T>* p);

    template <class T>
        shared_ptr<T> atomic_load(const shared_ptr<T>* p);
    template <class T>
        shared_ptr<T> atomic_load_explicit(const shared_ptr<T>* p, memory_order mo);

    template <class T>
        void atomic_store(shared_ptr<T>* p, shared_ptr<T> r);
    template <class T>
        void atomic_store_explicit(shared_ptr<T>* p, shared_ptr<T> r, memory_order mo);

    template <class T>
        shared_ptr<T> atomic_exchange(shared_ptr<T>* p, shared_ptr<T> r);
    template <class T>
        shared_ptr<T> atomic_exchange_explicit(shared_ptr<T>* p, shared_ptr<T> r, memory_order mo);

    template <class T>
        bool atomic_compare_exchange_weak(
            shared_ptr<T>* p, shared_ptr<T>* v, shared_ptr<T> w);
    template <class T>
        bool atomic_compare_exchange_strong(}
Concurrent access to a `shared_ptr` object from multiple threads does not introduce a data race if the access is done exclusively via the functions in this section and the instance is passed as their first argument.

The meaning of the arguments of type `memory_order` is explained in 33.5.4 [atomics.order].

- **template<class T>**
  ```cpp
  bool atomic_compare_exchange_weak_explicit(
    shared_ptr<T>* p, shared_ptr<T>* v, shared_ptr<T> w,
    memory_order success, memory_order failure);
  ```

- **template<class T>**
  ```cpp
  bool atomic_compare_exchange_strong_explicit(
    shared_ptr<T>* p, shared_ptr<T>* v, shared_ptr<T> w,
    memory_order success, memory_order failure);
  ```

- **template<class T>**
  ```cpp
  bool atomic_is_lock_free(const shared_ptr<T>* p);
  ```

  **Requires Preconditions:** `p` shall not be null.

  **Returns:** `true` if atomic access to `*p` is lock-free, `false` otherwise.

- **template<class T>**
  ```cpp
  shared_ptr<T> atomic_load(const shared_ptr<T>* p);
  ```

  **Requires Preconditions:** `p` shall not be null.

  **Returns:** `atomic_load_explicit(p, memory_order::seq_cst)`.

  **Throws:** Nothing.

- **template<class T>**
  ```cpp
  shared_ptr<T> atomic_load_explicit(const shared_ptr<T>* p, memory_order mo);
  ```

  **Requires Preconditions:** `p` shall not be null.

  **Requires Preconditions:** `mo` shall not be `memory_order::acquire` nor `memory_order::acq_rel`.

  **Returns:** `*p`.

  **Throws:** Nothing.

- **template<class T>**
  ```cpp
  void atomic_store(shared_ptr<T>* p, shared_ptr<T> r);
  ```

  **Requires Preconditions:** `p` shall not be null.

  **Effects:** As if by `atomic_store_explicit(p, r, memory_order::seq_cst)`.

  **Throws:** Nothing.

- **template<class T>**
  ```cpp
  void atomic_store_explicit(shared_ptr<T>* p, shared_ptr<T> r, memory_order mo);
  ```

  **Requires Preconditions:** `p` shall not be null.

  **Requires:** `mo` shall not be `memory_order::acquire` or `memory_order::acq_rel`.

  **Effects:** As if by `p->swap(r)`.

  **Throws:** Nothing.
template<class T>
  shared_ptr<T> atomic_exchange(shared_ptr<T>* p, shared_ptr<T> r);

Requires
Preconditions: p shall not be null.

Returns: atomic_exchange_explicit(p, r, memory_order::seq_cst).

Throws: Nothing.

template<class T>
  shared_ptr<T> atomic_exchange_explicit(shared_ptr<T>* p, shared_ptr<T> r, memory_order mo);

Requires
Preconditions: p shall not be null.

Effects: As if by p->swap(r).

Returns: The previous value of *p.

Throws: Nothing.

template<class T>
  bool atomic_compare_exchange_weak(shared_ptr<T>* p, shared_ptr<T>* v, shared_ptr<T> w);

Requires
Preconditions: p shall not be null.

Returns: atomic_compare_exchange_weak_explicit(p, v, w, memory_order::seq_cst, memory_order::seq_cst).

Throws: Nothing.

template<class T>
  bool atomic_compare_exchange_strong(shared_ptr<T>* p, shared_ptr<T>* v, shared_ptr<T> w);

Returns: atomic_compare_exchange_strong_explicit(p, v, w, memory_order::seq_cst, memory_order::seq_cst).

template <class T>
  bool atomic_compare_exchange_weak_explicit(
    shared_ptr<T>* p, shared_ptr<T>* v, shared_ptr<T> w,
    memory_order success, memory_order failure);

template <class T>
  bool atomic_compare_exchange_strong_explicit(
    shared_ptr<T>* p, shared_ptr<T>* v, shared_ptr<T> w,
    memory_order success, memory_order failure);

Requires
Preconditions: p shall not be null and v shall not be null. The failure argument shall not be
neither memory_order::release nor memory_order::acq_rel.

Effects: If *p is equivalent to *v, assigns w to *p and has synchronization semantics corresponding to the value of
success, otherwise assigns *p to *v and has synchronization semantics corresponding to the value of failure.

Returns: true if *p was equivalent to *v, false otherwise.

Throws: Nothing.

Remarks: Two shared_ptr objects are equivalent if they store the same pointer value and share ownership. The
weak form may fail spuriously. See 33.5.8.2 [atomics.types.operations].

D.27 [depr.conversions] Deprecated convenience conversion interfaces

D.27.1 [depr.conversions.general] General

The header <locale> (30.2 [locale.syn]) has the following additions:

namespace std {
  template<class Codecvt, class Elem = wchar_t,
D.27.2 [depr.conversions.string] Class template wstring_convert

Class template wstring_convert performs conversions between a wide string and a byte string. It lets you specify a code conversion facet (like class template codecvt) to perform the conversions, without affecting any streams or locales.

[Example 1: If you want to use the code conversion facet codecvt_utf8 to output to cout a UTF-8 multibyte sequence corresponding to a wide string, but you don’t want to alter the locale for cout, you can write something like:

```cpp
std::wstring_convert<std::codecvt_utf8<wchar_t>> myconv;
std::string mbstring = myconv.to_bytes(L"Hello\n");
std::cout << mbstring;
```

--- end example]

namespace std {
  template <class Codecvt, class Elem = wchar_t,
             class WideAlloc = allocator<Elem>,
             class ByteAlloc = allocator<char>>
  class wstring_convert {
    public:
      using byte_string = basic_string<char, char_traits<char>, ByteAlloc>;
      using wide_string = basic_string<Elem, char_traits<Elem>, WideAlloc>;
      using state_type = typename Codecvt::state_type;
      using int_type = typename wide_string::traits_type::int_type;

      wstring_convert() : wstring_convert(new Codecvt) {}
      explicit wstring_convert(Codecvt* pcvt = new Codecvt);
      wstring_convert(Codecvt* pcvt, state_type state);
      explicit wstring_convert(const byte_string& byte_err,
                               const wide_string& wide_err = wide_string());
      ~wstring_convert();

      wstring_convert(const wstring_convert&) = delete;
      wstring_convert& operator=(const wstring_convert&) = delete;

      wide_string from_bytes(char byte);
      wide_string from_bytes(const char* ptr);
      wide_string from_bytes(const byte_string& str);
      wide_string from_bytes(const char* first, const char* last);

      byte_string to_bytes(Elem wchar);
      byte_string to_bytes(const Elem* wptr);
      byte_string to_bytes(const wide_string& wstr);
      byte_string to_bytes(const Elem* first, const Elem* last);
  }
}
size_t converted() const noexcept;  
state_type state() const;

private:
  byte_string byte_err_string; // Exposition only
  wide_string wide_err_string; // Exposition only
  Codecvt* cvtptr; // Exposition only
  state_type cvtstate; // Exposition only
  size_t cvtcount; // Exposition only
};

2 The class template describes an object that controls conversions between wide string objects of class
basic_string<Elem, char_traits<Elem>, WideAlloc> and byte string objects of class
basic_string<char, char_traits<char>, ByteAlloc>. The class template defines the types wide_string
and byte_string as synonyms for these two types. Conversion between a sequence of Elem values
(stored in a wide_string object) and multibyte sequences (stored in a byte_string object) is per-
formed by an object of class Codecvt, which meets the requirements of the standard code-conversion
facet codecvt<Elem, char, mbstate_t>.

3 An object of this class template stores:
   — byte_err_string — a byte string to display on errors
   — wide_err_string — a wide string to display on errors
   — cvtptr — a pointer to the allocated conversion object (which is freed when the wstring_convert object
     is destroyed)
   — cvtstate — a conversion state object
   — cvtcount — a conversion count

size_t converted() const noexcept;

4 Returns: cvtcount.

wide_string from_bytes(char byte);
wide_string from_bytes(const char* ptr);
wide_string from_bytes(const byte_string& str);
wide_string from_bytes(const char* first, const char* last);

5 Effects: The first member function shall convert the single-element sequence byte to a wide string. The second
member function shall convert the null-terminated sequence beginning at ptr to a wide string. The third member
function shall convert the sequence stored in str to a wide string. The fourth member function shall convert
the sequence defined by the range \([first, last)\) to a wide string.

In all cases:
   — If the cvtstate object was not constructed with an explicit value, it shall be set to its default value (the
     initial conversion state) before the conversion begins. Otherwise it shall be left unchanged.
   — The number of input elements successfully converted shall be stored in cvtcount.

6 Returns: If no conversion error occurs, the member function shall return the converted wide string. Otherwise,
if the object was constructed with a wide-error string, the member function shall return the wide-error string.
Otherwise, the member function throws an object of class range_error.

state_type state() const;

8 Returns: cvtstate.

byte_string to_bytes(Elem wchar);
byte_string to_bytes(const Elem* wptr);
byte_string to_bytes(const wide_string& wstr);
byte_string to_bytes(const Elem* first, const Elem* last);

9 Effects: The first member function shall convert the single-element sequence wchar to a byte string. The second member function shall convert the null-terminated sequence beginning at wptr to a byte string. The third member function shall convert the sequence stored in wstr to a byte string. The fourth member function shall convert the sequence defined by the range \( (first, last) \) to a byte string.

10 In all cases:

   — If the cvtstate object was not constructed with an explicit value, it shall be set to its default value (the initial conversion state) before the conversion begins. Otherwise it shall be left unchanged.
   — The number of input elements successfully converted shall be stored in cvtcount.

11 Returns: If no conversion error occurs, the member function shall return the converted byte string. Otherwise, if the object was constructed with a byte-error string, the member function shall return the byte-error string. Otherwise, the member function shall throw an object of class range_error.

```
explicit wstring_convert(Codecvt* pcvt = new Codecvt);
wstring_convert(Codecvt* pcvt, state_type state);
explicit wstring_convert(const byte_string& byte_err,
            const wide_string& wide_err = wide_string());
```

12 Requires Preconditions: For the first and second constructors, pcvt != nullptr.

13 Effects: The first constructor shall store pcvt in cvtptr and default values in cvtstate, byte_err_string, and wide_err_string. The second constructor shall store pcvt in cvtptr, state in cvtstate, and default values in byte_err_string and wide_err_string; moreover the stored state shall be retained between calls to from_bytes and to_bytes. The third constructor shall store new Codecvt in cvtptr, state_type() in cvtstate, byte_err in byte_err_string, and wide_err in wide_err_string.

```
~wstring_convert();
```

14 Effects: The destructor shall delete cvtptr.

D.27.3 [depr.conversions.buffer] Class template wbuffer_convert

1 Class template wbuffer_convert looks like a wide stream buffer, but performs all its I/O through an underlying byte stream buffer that you specify when you construct it. Like class template wstring_convert, it lets you specify a code conversion facet to perform the conversions, without affecting any streams or locales.

```cpp
namespace std {
template <class Codecvt, class Elem = wchar_t, class Tr = char_traits<Elem>>
class wbuffer_convert
    : public basic_streambuf<Elem, Tr> {
public:
    using state_type = typename Codecvt::state_type;

    wbuffer_convert() : wbuffer_convert(nullptr) {}
    explicit wbuffer_convert(streambuf* bytebuf = 0,
                              Codecvt* pcvt = new Codecvt,
                              state_type state = state_type());

    ~wbuffer_convert();

    wbuffer_convert(const wbuffer_convert&) = delete;
    wbuffer_convert& operator=(const wbuffer_convert&) = delete;

    streambuf* rdbuf() const;
```
The class template describes a stream buffer that controls the transmission of elements of type Elem, whose character traits are described by the class Tr, to and from a byte stream buffer of type streambuf. Conversion between a sequence of Elem values and multibyte sequences is performed by an object of class Codecvt, which shall meet the requirements of the standard code-conversion facet codecvt<Elem, char, mbstate_t>.

An object of this class template stores:

— bufptr — a pointer to its underlying byte stream buffer
— cvtptr — a pointer to the allocated conversion object (which is freed when the wbuffer_convert object is destroyed)
— cvtstate — a conversion state object

state_type state() const;

streambuf* rdbuf() const;

streambuf* rdbuf(streambuf* bytebuf);

Returns: cvtstate.

streambuf* rdbuf() const;

Returns: bufptr.

streambuf* rdbuf(streambuf* bytebuf);

Effects: Stores bytebuf in bufptr.

Returns: The previous value of bufptr.

explicit wbuffer_convert(streambuf* bytebuf = 0,
    Codecvt* pcvt = new Codecvt, state_type state = state_type());

Requires Preconditions: pcvt != nullptr.

Effects: The constructor constructs a stream buffer object, initializes bufptr to bytebuf, initializes cvtptr to pcvt, and initializes cvtstate to state.

~wbuffer_convert();

Effects: The destructor shall delete cvtptr.

D.29 [depr.fs.path.factory] Deprecated filesystem path factory functions

The header <filesystem> (31.12.4 [fs.filesystem.syn]) has the following additions:

template<class Source>
    path u8path(const Source& source);

template<class InputIterator>
    path u8path(InputIterator first, InputIterator last);

Requires: The source and \[first, last) sequences are UTF-8 encoded. The value type of Source and InputIterator is char or char8_t. Source meets the requirements specified in 31.12.6.4 [fs.path.req].

Mandates: The value type of Source and InputIterator is char or char8_t.
Preconditions: The source and \([\text{first, last})\) sequences are UTF-8 encoded. Source meets the requirements specified in 31.12.6.4 [fs.path.req].

Returns:

- If \(\text{path}::\text{value_type}\) is \(\text{char}\) and the current native narrow encoding (31.12.6.3.2 [fs.path.type.cvt]) is UTF-8, return \(\text{path(source)}\) or \(\text{path(first, last)}\); otherwise,
- if \(\text{path}::\text{value_type}\) is \(\text{wchar_t}\) and the native wide encoding is UTF-16, or if \(\text{path}::\text{value_type}\) is \(\text{char16_t}\) or \(\text{char32_t}\), convert source or \([\text{first, last})\) to a temporary, \(\text{tmp}\), of type \(\text{path}::\text{string_type}\) and return \(\text{path(tmp)}\); otherwise,
- convert source or \([\text{first, last})\) to a temporary, \(\text{tmp}\), of type \(\text{u32string}\) and return \(\text{path(tmp)}\).

Remarks: Argument format conversion (31.12.6.3.1 [fs.path.fmt.cvt]) applies to the arguments for these functions. How Unicode encoding conversions are performed is unspecified.

Example 1: A string is to be read from a database that is encoded in UTF-8, and used to create a directory using the native encoding for filenames:

```cpp
namespace fs = std::filesystem;
std::string utf8_string = read_utf8_data();
fs::create_directory(fs::u8path(utf8_string));
```

For POSIX-based operating systems with the native narrow encoding set to UTF-8, no encoding or type conversion occurs.

For POSIX-based operating systems with the native narrow encoding not set to UTF-8, a conversion to UTF-32 occurs, followed by a conversion to the current native narrow encoding. Some Unicode characters may have no native character set representation.

For Windows-based operating systems a conversion from UTF-8 to UTF-16 occurs. —end example

Note: The example above is representative of a historical use of \(\text{filesystem}::\text{u8path}\). Passing a \(\text{std}::\text{u8string}\) to \(\text{path}::\text{construct}\) is preferred for an indication of UTF-8 encoding more consistent with \(\text{path}::\text{construct}\)’s handling of other encodings. —end note

7 Acknowledgements

Thanks to Michael Parks for the pandoc-based framework used to transform this document’s source from Markdown.

8 References


