

Document number: P2396R0

Date: 2021-06-14

Reply-to: David Goldblatt <davidtgoldblatt@gmail.com>

Audience: LEWG

# P2396R0: Concurrency TS 2 fixes

## Background

LEWG has forwarded several papers to LWG targeting the next version of the concurrency TS:

- P0561: An RAII Interface for Deferred Reclamation
- P1121: Hazard Pointers: Proposed Interface and Wording for Concurrency TS 2
- P1122: Proposed Wording for Concurrent Data Structures: Read-Copy-Update (RCU)
- P1202: Asymmetric Fences
- P1478: Byte-wise atomic memcpy

(Some of these have progressed further -- P1121 and P1122 were approved in June plenary for inclusion in the TS).

During LWG pre-review of P1202, Jens Maurer noticed that while its additions were specified to be in the [atomics] clause, the paper did not actually specify that the functions would be added to the <atomic> header. A subsequent LEWG reflector discussion indicated a desire for a header under experimental/, which the other TS-targeting papers don't do. Under a little more scrutiny, the discussion also uncovered nits in the various papers. This paper fixes the various nits.

Procedurally, this is a racy process because of the various pipeline stages involved. I suggest that these changes get merged into the corresponding papers if they catch them at a pipeline stage, and otherwise into the TS itself (at least in the case of P1121 and P1122).

## Header names

No forwarded proposal placed itself under the experimental folder. P1202 was forwarded despite not specifying a header at all. The LEWG mailing list discussion was uniformly in favor of the experimental/ folder. There was some discussion of whether or not the headers should be fine-grained (roughly: per-proposal) or not. I suggest fine-grained headers, for two reasons:

- This allows different vendors to implement different parts of the TS more easily (e.g. some companies have expressed support for "donating" partial implementations of some proposals).
- This is existing TS practice.

The proposed changes are therefore:

Change P0561's synopsis header from <snapshot> to <experimental/snapshot>

Change P1121's synopsis header from <hazard\_pointer> to <experimental/hazard\_pointer>  
Change P1122's synopsis header from <rcu> to <experimental/rcu>

P1202 neglected to introduce a synopsis or to explicitly specify the header. The LWG pre-reviewer asked for P1202 to enter LWG's queue with the pre-review revisions regardless of the LEWG followup discussion on header names, and it did so with <atomic> as the header. The proposed change is therefore:  
Change P1202's synopsis header from <atomic> to <experimental/asymmetric\_fence>.

P1478 does not explicitly alter or introduce a synopsis, but does say that its insertions are into <atomic>. However, if we believe in fine-grained headers for TSs, this should change names anyways. The change is therefore:  
Introduce a synopsis section to P1478, making the header <experimental/bytewise\_atomic\_memcpy>

## Feature detection macros

Of the papers, only P1478 includes a feature-detection macro (P1122s claim that it introduced them after a LEWG discussion, but does not; in any case the names it proposes do not match the existing conventions). P1478 introduces `__cpp_lib_bytewise_atomic_memcpy`, which does not following existing TS conventions.

Existing TSs expose library feature detection with the macro prefix `__cpp_lib_experimental` defined globally (i.e. not inserted into <version>, as standardized functionality is). Once the TS is finalized, it will (assuming it follows the same pattern) have wording like:

An implementation that provides support for this document shall define the feature test macro(s) in Table X:

Title	Subclause	Macro name	Value	Header
Foo	X	<code>__cpp_lib_experimental_foo</code>	2021XX	<experimental/foo>
Bar	Y	<code>__cpp_lib_experimental_bar</code>	2021YY	<experimental/bar>

I suggest following this convention for the Concurrency TS.

For P0561:

Add a definition of `__cpp_lib_experimental_snapshot` into <experimental/snapshot>

For P1121:

Add a definition of `__cpp_lib_experimental_hazard_pointer` into <experimental/hazard\_pointer>

For P1122:

Add a definition of `__cpp_lib_experimental_rcu` into <experimental/rcu>

For P1202:

Add a definition of `__cpp_lib_experimental_asymmetric_fence` into  
<experimental/asymmetric\_fence>

For P1478:

Add a definition of `__cpp_lib_experimental_bytewise_atomic_memcpy` into  
<experimental/bytewise\_atomic\_memcpy>, remove the insertion into <version>, remove the  
unprefixed definition.