

Dispositions of the SC22 Comments on PDTR 10182  
Guidelines for Languages Bindings

This document contains the dispositions of SC22/WG11 on the comments, made by several SC22 member bodies on the registration of PDTR 10182. The PDTR is in document SC22/N754, the summary of voting and comments is in document SC22/N791.

These dispositions were established by WG11 during its meeting in September 1990 in Amsterdam.

In section 1, the disposition of the comments is given and section 2 contains the record of changes. Comments were received from Canada, Japan, the U.K. and the U.S.A. The comments from Mr. Dawes (a U.K. expert's personal comments) are also reviewed. The comments are indicated by the name of the country (or Dawes) followed by the number of the comment.

All changes are considered to be editorial. Some changes imply extensive renumbering of the sections in the document (U.S.A.-10, Dawes-7); these are left for the editor for consideration.

## **1. Comments from SC22 Member Bodies**

### **1.1 Comments from Canada**

1. Comment accepted.
2. The guideline describes good practice, and is intended for future use. The standardization of POSIX DIS 9945-1 is the standardization of existing practice. In fact, guideline 2 decouples the responsibilities of the language committee and the system facility committee. This decoupling is strengthened by guideline 5.

### **1.2 Comments from Japan**

1. Comment accepted.
2. Comment accepted; comment will be added to the example indicating that the constants are defined elsewhere.
3. All comments accepted.

### **1.3 Comments from the U.K.**

1. Comment accepted.
2. Comment accepted; same change to guideline 44, page 35.
3. Included in Japan-3.

### **1.4 Comments from the U.S.A.**

1. See Canada-1.
2. The text in guideline 35 is not too clear; text is changed.
3. First part of comment is accepted; the second part (inclusion of references to SC21 documents) is not accepted, since these documents are not generally available.
4. Comment not accepted: these documents are not generally available.
5. Comment not accepted: these documents are not generally available.
6. Comment accepted.
7. Comment accepted.

8. Comment accepted.
9. The comment is accepted, but no change of wording is proposed.
10. The comment is accepted: guideline 33 and issue 10 will be deleted.
11. See U.S.A-2.
12. Guideline 36 is considered clear as it stands; not change of text.
13. Comment accepted, text adapted.

### 1.5 Comments from the Dawes (UK)

1. Comment accepted.
2. Comment accepted.
3. Comment not accepted: it is felt that method 5 does not need guidelines. Text in section 3.4.1 is changed.
4. Comment not accepted.
5. Comment accepted, sentence will be removed.
6. Comment accepted.
7. Comment accepted in principle. Decision left to the editor whether or not the scope of the suggested change is too big as it involves extensive renumbering.
8. Guideline 33 is removed (see U.S.A.-10).
9. LEFT, MIDDLE, RIGHT is not more "natural" than RIGHT, MIDDLE, LEFT, but both are more "natural" than LEFT, RIGHT, MIDDLE.
10. Comment accepted, text will be reworded.
11. Suggested change only for guideline 46.  
Data type names are treated different from function names, because in some languages data type names are not treated like identifiers.
12. The sense of the comment is not accepted, however the text is reworded.
13. There is sympathy for the comment; it is left to the editor to investigate what text should be changed.
14. Comment accepted.

## 2. Record of changes

Table of contents [Japan-3]

In line starting with 3.4.2: change "INterfaces" to "Interfaces"

Page 1, line 12 [Japan-3]

Replace "conficts" by "conflicts".

Page 4 [U.K.-2]

Replace "Minimal Basic" by "Minimal BASIC".

Page 4 [U.K.-1]

Replace reference to C by "Programming Languages - 'C', ISO/DIS 9899".

Page 4 [U.K.-1]

Replace reference to Extended Pascal by "Programming Languages - Extended Pascal, ISO/DIS 10206".

- Page 4, after reference to Fortran [U.S.A.-8]  
Add "Programming Languages - COBOL, ISO/IS 1989".
- Page 4 [U.S.A.-3]  
Replace reference to NDL by "Information Processing Systems - Database Language - NDL, ISO 8907"
- Page 4 [U.S.A.-3]  
Replace reference to SQL by "Information Processing Systems - Database Language - SQL, ISO 9075"
- Page 4 [Dawes-1]  
Replace reference to Ada by "Programming Languages - Ada, ISO 8652".  
Move this reference after the COBOL reference.
- Page 5, line 26 [Japan-1]  
Remove "(qv)".
- Page 6, line 12 [Japan-3]  
Replace "a application" by "an application".
- Page 6, 3rd line from bottom [U.S.A.-6]  
Replace "DIS 8907" by "IS 8907"
- Page 7, line 10 [U.S.A.-6]  
Replace "ISO/DIS 8907" by "IS 8907"
- Page 7, line 33 [U.S.A.-6]  
Replace "DIS 9075" by "IS 9075"
- Page 9, line 32 [Japan-3]  
Replace "chosing" by "choosing".
- Page 16, guideline 2 [Dawes-2]  
Remove 2nd sentence of guideline ("Different language ... structure.").
- Page 16, 2nd para after guideline 2, first sentence [Canada-1]  
Replace "It is expected ... committees" by "It is expected that it is the primary responsibility of the system facility committee to establish a reference binding to an arbitrary language and a generic binding. Subsequent bindings should be the responsibility of the appropriate language committees. In practice it is expected that the system facility committee will seek support from the applicable language committee in the creation of an arbitrary binding".
- Page 22, section 3.4.1 [Dawes-3]  
Remove "each of" in the only sentence.
- Page 23, guideline 13 [Dawes-5]  
Remove last sentence of 2nd paragraph after guideline 13 ("ISO/IEC ... bindings.").
- Page 24, line 28 [Japan-3]  
Replace "preceeding" by "preceding".
- Page 25, guideline 18 [Dawes-6]  
After guideline 18 add "See also guidelines 44 and 45.".
- Page 25, guideline 19 [Dawes-6]  
After guideline 19 add "See also guidelines 44 and 45.".
- Page 26, line 16-17 [Japan-3]  
Remove "between".

- Page 31, guideline 33 [U.S.A.-10]  
Remove guideline 33, and renumber all subsequent guidelines.
- Page 32, guideline 35 [U.S.A.-2]  
Replace "Added parameters" by "Extra parameters, required by a language".
- Page 34, guideline 41 [U.S.A.-13]  
Replace "must be distinguishable from user-defined functions" by "should be distinguishable from user-defined functions as long as the language allows this."
- Page 34, guideline 42 [Dawes-10]  
Replace text of guideline 42 by "Abbreviations should be generated from the functional interface standard names in a consistent manner."  
  
Insert the following text before reference to issue 19:  
"This provides a relatively straightforward method of mapping binding identifiers back to the functional interface standard.  
  
One way of achieving this guideline is to eliminate unnecessary words."
- Page 35, guideline 44 [U.K.-2]  
Replace "Basic" by "BASIC" (2 times).
- Page 36, guideline 46 [Dawes-11]  
Replace "data types" by "names of data types" (twice).
- Page 37, guideline 48 [Dawes-12]  
Replace "from, nor contain direct detailed references to the functional standard, nor should they attempt" by "from the functional standard. Also they should not attempt".  
Insert before last sentence: "Overdetailed references from the bindings documents to the functional standard should be avoided."
- Page 45, line 8 [Japan-2]  
Add "(\* The constants are defined elsewhere \*)".
- Page 46 [Dawes-14]  
Separate figure 6 from figure 7.
- Page 48, line 23 [Japan-3]  
Replace "preceeding" by "preceding".
- Page 49, line 27 [Japan-3]  
Replace "dominent" by "dominant".
- Page 51, line 34 [Japan-3]  
Replace "denomonator" by "denominator".
- Page 55, issue 10 [U.S.A.-10]  
Remove issue 10, and renumber all subsequent issues. Note that all the issue references must be corrected as well.
- Page 61, line 13 [Japan-3]  
Replace "sentinal" by "sentinel".
- Page 63, Issue 21 [U.K.-2]  
Replace "Basic" by "BASIC" (3 times).
- Page 63, line 30 [Japan-3]  
Replace "occurence" by "occurrence".