

DISPOSITION OF COMMENTS ON WDTR 10000-1.3 (N442)

The following contributions were received on the first working draft of TR 10000-1.3. They were reviewed during the SGFS meeting in June 1992, and action was identified for processing by the Editors of TR 10000-1 and TR 10000-3. **(Sorted into N442 page/line order)**

Origin (N###)	Item	Also see:	Type	Page/Line	Clause	Subject	Action
Canada (N498)	C-01					Acceptance of N442	
Denmark (N518)	DK-01					Acceptance of N442	
France (N519)	FR-01	IT-07 EW-14	M	01/31-36 03/Passim	Fwd 1	Overall structure of TR and review of scope of different classes of Profiles in the Taxonomy	A key issue is the extent to which there is both need and resource to extend "Functional Profiles" as described under Topic 1, and to identify where the available base standards are sufficient in themselves without profiling. Accepted as a basis for progressing TR 10000. N608 contains first outline of ideas. Preferable to keep Part 3 for Generic OSE Profiles, and Part 4 (and possibly other parts) cover other Functional Profiles. Drop the reference to AEPs - they may be more akin to OSE Profile class.
	US-02		e	02/13 05/10 10/22 14/11	Intro 3.1.2 6.3.2 7.1	Use "conforming subset" in place of "subset"	Accept for TR 10000-1.3. In the case of 1.2, only change the introduction as requested, on the basis that this will be aligned through 1.3 in due course.
Italy (N516)	IT-01	US-12 IT-02	M	02/15 06/35 07/08-09	Intro 5 5	Extension of description of the generic purpose of Profiles to include "integration infrastructures"	Emphasise relationship to a broader domain of user requirements than is currently implied by TR 10000
	US-03		e	03/20 29/03	1 C	Annex C limited to "OSI Profile Conformance"	This will be removed from TR 10000-1.3; it may reappear in some form in Part 2, but only when 9646-7 is stable.
	US-04		e	03/26	1	Clarification of "These" and "Those"	Accepted
	US-05		e	03/49	1	Use of "may"	Revise this text wholesale for the TR 10000 restructuring exercise. Accept the intent of the comment.
	IT-02	IT-01	M	03/49-50	1	Similar to IT-1 above	Comment withdrawn.
Germany (N517)	G-01		m	03/50	1	Delete ref to ODP, add POSIX as examples of extension of scope of TR 10000	Revise this text wholesale as for US-05. If ODP is mentioned (as an area of work, not as specific standards), then include POSIX as well.
	G-02	EW-12	e	04/53	2	Request for distribution of, and reference to, IEEE 1003.3 (POSIX Conformance)	See N591 for further US comment. See N528 for P1003.3. Coming into SC22/15. Really a TR 10000-3 issue to include this.

WDTR 10000-1.3: Disposition of Comments on N442 ISO/IEC JTC1/SGFS N618

	IT-03		E m	05/01 05/42	3 3.1	a)Reposition clause 3 Definitions. b)Add term "Taxonomy"	Withdrawn
	US-06	US-14	m	05/18	3.1.3	Permitted scope of normative/ informative references in ISPs	Remove the whole note.
	US-07	US-10 EW-01 EW-09	E	05/23 05/32	3.1.5 3.1.7	Rationalising definitions of OSI and AE Profiles	Accept, add in EWOS-01 change, reverse order to define OSE first. What about the functional/generic distinction? Don't change "OSI Profile" to "OSI Funct Profile", but include "functional" inside the definition. May need extra definitions of "generic" and "functional" profiles.
EWOS (N521)	EW-01	US-07	m	05/23	3.1.5	Change wording of "adheres" to OSI RM	Accepted - apply to proposed wording in US-07
	EW-02	US-08 EW-13	m	05/37	3.1.8	Removal of definition of "Group"	Accepted
	US-08		m	05/37	3.1.8	Generalising of "Group" terminology.	Not changed because the text is being removed from Part 1 . May want to reintroduce this or something like it in Part 3. Don't destabilise OSI "Group" usage.
	EW-03	FR-02	m	05/42	3.1	Add definition of "Portability"	Keep definitions of TSG-1 available for use; amend to include Application software;
	FR-02	EW-03	m	05/42	3.1	Add definitions: a)Portability. b)Interoperability	Add IEEE definition of Interoperability as provided at SGFS
	G-03		M	05/43 07/39-45	3.2 6	Conformance testing concepts and terminology; generalisation in TR 10000-1, specifics in other parts. See also US-1	Issue for Part 2 for OSI and ODA references, and for Part 3 for OSE material as needed. Generic conformance and testing material to be added to clause 6.
	US-09		e	05/50,53	3.2	Singular "requirement"	Accepted
	US-10	US-07	e	06/26	5	Harmonising definition of Profile	Accepted. (Extra wording change proposed: "..functions (e.g. interoperability) or support a class of applications (e.g. TP applications??))
	US-11		e	07/06	5	Deletion of ref to "test laboratories"	Accepted - but replace by "test methods"
	US-12	IT-01	e	07/08-09	5	Extensibility of scope of TR	Accepted in principle; but to retain the concept of "implementation in real systems", would a combination of the two sets of words serve: "..but to promote the implementation of the base standards in real systems in such a way as to achieve the intended goals of the standards - for example, interoperability or portability". Reorder text to get it out of the coformance testing bit - e.g. in the bullet list on page 6.
USA (N520)	US-01	G-03	E	07/37-45 Passim	6 Passim	Align with TR 10000-1.2 where appropriate.	Carry forward test in TR 10000-1.2 to 1.3 as appropriate. Add generic testing material as and when available.
	US-13	IT-04	e	08/01-02	6.1.1	Align clauses 6.1.1 and 6.1.3a	Editor to adjust as advised

WDTR 10000-1.3: Disposition of Comments on N442 ISO/IEC JTC1/SGFS N618

IT-04	US-13	e	08/04-07	6.1.1	Replace example by reference to 6.3.1(a)	Editor to adjust as advised.
EW-05		e	08/10 08/21	6.1.2 6.1.3	Clarify sub-clause titles	Accepted
US-14	US-06	m	08/13	6.1.2	Reference to Technical Reports	Adopt TR 10000-1.2 solution
EW-04		e	08/18	6.1.2	"Sectoral" for "Sectional"	Accepted
EW-06	FR-03	m	08/24	6.1.3	Deletion of "informative part of ISP"	Place "within informative text in an ISP"
FR-03	EW-06	e	08/25	6.1.3	Concern over "non-normative" terminology	Change "non-normative" to "informative" (also in 6.1.3b (page 8/line 46) and in heading of Annex D) - that's the correct term according to the Directives Part 3.
EW-07	FR-04	m	08/51	6.1.3b	Handling taxonomy where missing functionality occurs	Second para will not be needed if agreement is reached on US position on Gaps in N591: first para reference to pointer may also need changing to statement of requirements
FR-04	EW-07	m	08/52	6.1.3b	Handling taxonomy where missing functionality occurs	See above
US-15		m	09/13-20	6.2	ISP as Registration Agent	As agreed for TR 10000-1.2 (N612)
G-04		e	09/30 09/40	3.1 3.1a	Clarification of wording	Accepted
US-16		e	09/31	6.3.1	Implicit and explicit relationships between base standards	Yes - "can"
US-17		e	10/18 08/54	6.3.2d 6.1.3c	Clarifying scope of informative references	Accepted in principle; a)add reference to "6.1.3" to item (d) b)add item (c) to 6.1.3 as proposed (but with reference to Annex A.4.3 rather than Directives). Some editing of the text or position of the para starting page 8/line 55 may also be necessary - it probably doesn't refer to the new item (c) (but move to end of the list (f))
US-18		e	10/21	6.3.2e	Deleting reference to "recommendations"	Accepted
EW-08		m	10/42	6.3.3	Removal of OSI-specific material to TR 10000-2	Review 6.3.3 to make it truly generic and not require ad hoc extension as TR grows.
EW-09	US-07 US-10	M	10/45	6.3.3	Example of AEP definition characteristics	As above
US-19		e	10/52	6.4.1	Extent of testing	Accepted
G-06	G-02 US-23	E	11/01	6.4.1	Generality of "Static and Dynamic Conformance" concepts	The text of 6.4 to 6.7 will need to be converted into generic conformance/testing information. Some material will go into part 2, some into part 3, and some new text will be needed. NBs and LOs should be asked for input on the likely form and content of this text. In the meantime, the editor will construct a first attempt for the next circulation of TR 10000-1.3

WDTR 10000-1.3: Disposition of Comments on N442 ISO/IEC JTC1/SGFS N618

	EW-10	US-20	M	11/04	6.4.1	Creation of Generic Conformance text	See above
	US-20	EW-10	e	11/08-09	6.4.1	Lack of PICS proformas	Accepted, though it would be better to change it from a note into a requirement, and retain the "shall". (This is text which will become generalised into the "ICS" terminology of ISO 9646-6 when it is considered sufficiently stable). (Also affected by action on G-06)
	US-21		e	11/16	6.4.1	Delete "But"	Accepted but affected by G-06
	EW-11	var	e	11/20	6.4.2	Correct Clause number	Accepted
	FR-05	var	e	11/20	6.4.2	Correct Clause number	Accepted
	US-22	var	e	11/20	6.4.2	Correct Clause number	Accepted
	IT-05	var	e	11/20	6.4.2	Correct Clause number	Accepted
	G-05	var	e	11/20	6.4.2	Correct Clause number	Accepted
	EW-12	G-02	M	12/03	6.4.4	Proposed text on AEP Conformance	See action on G-06
	US-23	G-06	E	13/30	6.7	Restriction of "Dynamic conformance" to OSI	See action on G-06
	US-24	IT-06	e	14/31	7.1	Refer to appropriate taxonomy documents	Accepted - as in IT-6; the second proposed clause is not correct, since this part of TR 10000 is definitive, not illustrative regarding the primary classification. But the whole of 7.1 will need to be reviewed to accomodate all concepts of extensibility in the future. See also Issue 19 in N624
	IT-06	US-24	e	14/31	7.1	Refer to updated TR 10000 structure	As for IT-06
	US-25		e	14/58	7.2.1	Remove OSI reference	Accepted
	EW-13		M	15/01	7.2.1	Removal of OSI-specific material to TR 10000-2	Accepted
	IT-07	FR-01 EW-14	M	15/23	7.2.2	Relationship of terms OSE and AEP, scope of TR 10000-3, "generic" versus "specific" profiles.	Impacted by new structure. Resolution of AEP terminology issue needed. Review parts of sect 5 of TSG-1 report that address portability (5.5.3 relationship of AEP to OSE). (Issue 15 in N624)
	EW-14	FR-01 IT-07	M	15/25	7.2.2	Proposal for top of AEP Taxonomy	Review with N535/6
	US-26		e	16/54	8.2	Consistency of IPRLs in multi-part ISPs	It is certainly intended, and is already the case in completed ISPs, that the IPRL for a Profile may be constructed by references to IPRL-fragments in other ISP-parts. (For instance, see N455 Annex A, (PDISP 10608-4), which references ISP 10608-1 Annex A). The text in 8.2 regarding multi-part ISPs, affects the actual ISP structure given in Table 1. Editor to revisit the question and if necessary add text to 8.4.3 as well.
	US-27		e	17/12	8.2b	Meaning of "section of a profile"	Leave it; US look at it again in the light of discussion.
	US-28		e	17/44	8.2	Scope of Note 2	Rewrite to avoid explicit reference to either OSI or OSE

WDTR 10000-1.3: Disposition of Comments on N442 ISO/IEC JTC1/SGFS N618

	US-29		e	17/51	8.2	Reference by one Profile to another in its totality	Accepted
	US-30		e	20/04-08	8.4.3	Combined IPRL and PICS Proforma	Accepted
	US-31		m	20/18	8.4.3	Additional test cases	Accepted as far as it is relevant for this Part; also for Part 2(9646-6 related)