Proposal for C2y

WG14 N3326

Title: Standardize strnlen and wcsnlen (v3)

Author, affiliation: Christopher Bazley, Arm. (WG14 member in individual capacity – GPU expert.)

Date: 2024-09-01

Proposal category: Feature

Target audience: General Developers, Library Developers

Abstract: This paper proposes that the POSIX functions strnlen and wcsnlen be incorporated into the

C standard.

Prior art: POSIX, GNU C library, Linux.

Standardize strnlen and wcsnlen (v3)

Reply-to: Christopher Bazley (chris.bazley@arm.com)

Document No: N3326 Date: 2024-09-01

Summary of Changes

N3252

Initial proposal

N3289

- Added an alternative example implementation of strnlen that uses memchr.
- Revised the proposed wording changes for strnlen and wcsnlen and the associated rationale.
- Added possible wording changes for wcsncat, strnlen_s and wcsnlen_s to align their descriptions with the new wording proposed for strnlen and wcsnlen.

N3326

- Added "The implementation shall behave as if it reads the (wide) characters sequentially and stops as soon as a null (wide) character is found."
- Added alternative proposed wording based on the existing description of strspn.
- Mentioned the use case of computing the length of null-padded fixed size strings.
- Added examples of unusual strnlen s usage that are presumed to be valid.
- Removed the proposed change to the maxsize parameter name of the Annex K functions.

Rationale

The requirement to determine the bounded length of a string is a common one. Consequently, many C libraries provide the following functions to calculate that result for ordinary and wide character arrays:

```
#include <string.h>
size_t strnlen(const char s[.maxlen], size_t maxlen);

(strnlen(3) — Linux manual page [1])

#include <wchar.h>
size_t wcsnlen(const wchar_t s[.maxlen], size_t maxlen);
```

(wcsnlen(3) — Linux manual page [2])

These functions have been part of the GNU project's C library since at least 2001 [3] and later became part of the POSIX.1-2008 standard.

Instead of standardizing the strnlen and wcsnlen functions, WG14 chose to standardize similarly named functions as part of Annex K of the C11 standard:

```
#define __STDC_WANT_LIB_EXT1__ 1
#include <string.h>
size_t strnlen_s(const char *s, size_t maxsize);
```

(K.3.7.4.4 The strnlen s function, ISO/IEC 9899:2023)

```
#define __STDC_WANT_LIB_EXT1__ 1
#include <wchar.h>
size_t wcsnlen_s(const wchar_t *s, size_t maxsize);
```

```
(K.3.9.2.4.1 The wcsnlen s function, ISO/IEC 9899:2023)
```

Like the rest of Annex K, strnlen_s and wcsnlen_s are an optional extension. Implementers are under no obligation to provide them, and most (including Clang and GCC) do not. In turn, this is likely to have hindered adoption, because programmers cannot rely on those functions being present.

The rationale given for adding these functions was:

The strnlen_s function is useful when dealing with strings that might lack their terminating null character. That the function returns the number of elements in the array when no terminating null character is found causes many calculations to be more straightforward. The technical report itself uses strnlen_s extensively in expressing the runtime-constraints of functions.

The strnlen_s function is identical [sic] the Linux function strnlen

(Rationale for TR 24731 — Extensions to the C Library — Part I: Bounds-checking interfaces [4])

Why standardize a function that "is identical" to an already established function with a different name? (As a matter of fact, strnlen_s and strnlen are not quite identical: the latter has undefined behaviour if passed a null pointer.)

In N1967, Sebor and O'Donell proposed that Annex K be either removed from the next revision of the C standard or deprecated and then removed [5]. Periodically, the question of whether to follow through on this idea arises in the committee.

However, strnlen_s and wcsnlen_s differ from other Annex K functions:

Except for strnlen_s and wcsnlen_s, functions in the technical report have a "Runtime-constraints" section that lists a series of "shall" or "shall not" statements that the program must satisfy when calling a library function.

(Rationale for TR 24731 — Extensions to the C Library — Part I: Bounds-checking interfaces)

This means that implementors could easily provide strnlen_s and wcsnlen_s without concerning themselves with the thread-safety issues of runtime constraint handling which were described by Seacord in N2809 [6].

strnlen_s and wcsnlen_s also differ from most other Annex K functions in that they do not fully or partially duplicate the functionality of other standard functions. It would therefore be beneficial to users for their functionality to be mandatory, not an optional extension.

According to Annex K itself:

This annex provides alternative library functions that promote safer, more secure programming.

(K.1 Background, ISO/IEC 9899:2023)

In the opinion of this author, the inclusion of strnlen_s and wcsnlen_s in Annex K was a category mistake. Those functions do not exist primarily to serve the needs of secure programming: they are foundational to solving many problems.

It is impossible to implement the strndup function efficiently without strnlen, or code resembling it. The only alternative to iterating over the passed-in array to find the terminating null character would be to always allocate enough storage for the specified maximum number of characters. That will have a bad outcome if a caller passes SIZE_MAX (e.g., because strdup is implemented in terms of strndup).

A function like strnlen is also necessary to compute the length of strings that are padded with null characters to a fixed size rather than null terminated, such as RISC OS sprite names [7]. Given that a standard function, strncpy, is provided by ISO C to produce such strings, it makes sense to provide a function to compute their length (although they are not strings at all according to ISO C's definition of the term).

As noted by the authors of TR 24731, many operations cannot be economically described without recourse to a function resembling strnlen. That is also what motivated this paper: It's absurd to describe behaviour in terms of strnlen_s and wcsnlen_s (because those are the standard functions), only to have to search and replace those names with strnlen and wcsnlen to allow the code to be translated by a real implementation.

It could be argued that wcsnlen is less commonly used than strnlen and therefore does not merit inclusion. This author believes such irregularities (including the omission of wcsdup from C23) merely serve to provoke surprise and irritation from users, without significantly reducing the burden on implementers. It is also hard to reconcile omission of wcsnlen with continued inclusion of wcsnlen_s in the C standard, since space is thereby used describing a function that usually does not exist, instead of one which usually does.

Implementation

The strnlen and wcsnlen functions can be implemented using only a few lines of code but are not trivial to implement correctly. It is not beneficial to force strictly conforming programs to reinvent this wheel.

For example, the following implementation is subtly broken because s[p] is evaluated before p < n:

It sometimes erroneously reads n+1 characters instead of no more than n characters. The effects of this error would not be observable at runtime except when operating on an array that contains no null character, and probably not even then.

The following implementation [8] is believed to be correct:

```
#include <stddef.h>

size_t strnlen(const char *s, size_t n)
{
    size_t p;
    for (p = 0; p < n && s[p]; p++) {}
    return p;
}</pre>
```

The correct implementation is reasonably efficient for most modern CPU architectures. For example, the following translation is generated by Clang 18.1.0 for an Arm Cortex-M4 embedded processor:

```
strnlen:
        cmp
                 r1, #0
        itt
                 eq
                 r0, #0
        moveq
        bxeq
                 lr
                 r2, r0
        mov
                 r0, #0
        movs
.LBB0 2:
                                            @ =>This Inner Loop Header: Depth=1
        ldrb
                 r3, [r2, r0]
                 r3, #0
        cmp
        it
                 eq
        bxeq
                 lr
.LBB0 3:
                                                in Loop: Header=BB0_2 Depth=1
                 r0, #1
        adds
                 r1, r0
        cmp
        bne
                 .LBB0 2
                 r0, r\overline{1}
        mov
                 lr
```

It is alternatively possible to implement strnlen by using memchr to search for a null character in the given array [9]. This may be more efficient than a standalone implementation of strnlen, depending on how well memchr has been optimised:

```
#include <string.h>
size_t strnlen(const char *s, size_t n)
{
   const char *p = memchr(s, '\0', n);
   return p == NULL ? n : p - s;
}
```

The translation generated by Clang 18.1.0 for an Arm Cortex-M4 is also slightly shorter than that generated for the standalone implementation of strnlen:

```
strnlen:
        push
                 {r4, r5, r7, lr}
        mov
                 r4, r1
                 r1, #0
        movs
        mov
                 r2, r4
                 r5, r0
        mov
                 memchr
        bl
        cmp
                 r0, #0
        it
                 ne
                 r4, r0, r5
r0, r4
        subne
        mov
                 {r4, r5, r7, pc}
        pop
```

Proposed wording changes (alternative 1)

The wording proposed is a diff from the September 3, 2022 working draft [10]. Green text is new text, while red text is deleted text.

This alternative is based on the existing descriptions of strncat and memchr.

7.26.6.5 The strnlen function

Synopsis

1

```
#include <string.h>
size_t strnlen(const char *s, size_t n);
```

Description

2 The strnlen function counts not more than n characters (a null character and characters that follow it are not counted) in the array to which s points. At most the first n characters of s shall be accessed by strnlen. The implementation shall behave as if it reads the characters sequentially and stops as soon as a null character is found.

Returns

3 The strnlen function returns the number of characters that precede the terminating null character. If there is no null character in the first n characters of s then strnlen returns n.

7.31.4.3.2 The wcsncat function

Synopsis

1

```
#include <wchar.h>
wchar_t *wcsncat(wchar_t * restrict s1, const wchar_t * restrict s2, size_t n);
```

Description

2 The wcsncat function appends not more than n wide characters (a null wide character and those wide characters that follow it are not appended) from the array pointed to by s2 to the end of the wide string pointed to by s1. The initial wide character of s2 overwrites the null wide character at the end of s1. A terminating null wide character is always appended to the result.⁴²³⁾

Returns

3 The wcsncat function returns the value of s1.

7.31.4.7.3 The wcsnlen function

Synopsis

1

```
#include <wchar.h>
size_t wcsnlen(const wchar_t *s, size_t n);
```

Description

2 The wcsnlen function counts not more than n wide characters (a null wide character and wide characters that follow it are not counted) in the array to which s points. At most the first n wide characters of s shall be accessed by wcsnlen. The implementation shall behave as if it reads the wide characters sequentially and stops as soon as a null wide character is found.

Returns

3 The wcsnlen function returns the number of wide characters that precede the terminating null wide character. If there is no null wide character in the first n wide characters of s then wcsnlen returns n.

B.25 String handling <string.h>

```
size t strnlen(const char *s, size t n);
```

B.30 Extended multibyte/wide character utilities <wchar.h>

```
size t wcsnlen(const wchar t *s, size t n);
```

K.3.7.4.4 The strnlen s function

Synopsis

1

```
#define __STDC_WANT_LIB_EXT1__ 1
#include <string.h>
size_t strnlen_s(const char *s, size_t maxsize);
```

Description

2 The strnlen_s function computes the length of the string pointed to by s. counts not more than maxsize characters (a null character and characters that follow it are not counted) in the array to which s points. At most the first maxsize characters of s shall be accessed by strnlen_s. The implementation shall behave as if it reads the characters sequentially and stops as soon as a null character is found.

Returns

3 If s is a null pointer, 515) then the strnlen s function returns zero.

4 Otherwise, the <code>strnlen_s</code> function returns the number of characters that precede the terminating null character. If there is no null character in the first <code>maxsize</code> characters of <code>s</code> then <code>strnlen_s</code> returns <code>maxsize</code>. At most the first <code>maxsize</code> characters of <code>s</code> shall be accessed by <code>strnlen_s</code>.

K.3.9.2.4.1 The wcsnlen_s function

Synopsis

1

```
#define __STDC_WANT_LIB_EXT1__ 1
#include <wchar.h>
size_t wcsnlen_s(const wchar_t *s, size_t maxsize);
```

Description

2 The wcsnlen_s function computes the length of the wide string pointed to by s. counts not more than maxsize wide characters (a null wide character and wide characters that follow it are not counted) in the array to which s points. At most the first maxsize wide characters of s shall be accessed by wcsnlen_s. The implementation shall behave as if it reads the wide characters sequentially and stops as soon as a null wide character is found.

Returns

3 If s is a null pointer, ⁵³⁹⁾ then the wcsnlen s function returns zero.

4 Otherwise, the wcsnlen_s function returns the number of wide characters that precede the terminating null wide character. If there is no null wide character in the first maxsize wide characters of s then wcsnlen_s returns maxsize. At most the first maxsize wide characters of s shall be accessed by wcsnlen_s.

Proposed wording changes (alternative 2)

The wording proposed is a diff from the September 3, 2022 working draft [10]. Green text is new text, while red text is deleted text.

This alternative is based on the existing descriptions of strspn and memchr.

7.26.6.5 The strnlen function

Synopsis

1

```
#include <string.h>
size_t strnlen(const char *s, size_t n);
```

Description

2 The strnlen function computes the length of the maximum initial segment of the array pointed to by s which is not more than n characters and consists entirely of characters other than null. At most the first n characters of s shall be accessed by strnlen. The implementation shall behave as if it reads the characters sequentially and stops as soon as a null character is found.

Returns

3 The strnlen function returns the number of characters that precede the first null character, or n if a null character does not occur in the first n characters of the array.

7.31.4.7.3 The wcsnlen function

Synopsis

1

```
#include <wchar.h>
size_t wcsnlen(const wchar_t *s, size_t n);
```

Description

2 The wcsnlen function computes the length of the maximum initial segment of the array pointed to by s which is not more than n wide characters and consists entirely of wide characters other than null. At most the first n wide characters of s shall be accessed by wcsnlen. The implementation shall behave as if it reads the wide characters sequentially and stops as soon as a null wide character is found.

Returns

3 The wcsnlen function returns the number of wide characters that precede the first null wide character, or n if a null wide character does not occur in the first n wide characters of the array.

B.25 String handling <string.h>

```
size_t strnlen(const char *s, size_t n);
```

B.30 Extended multibyte/wide character utilities < wchar.h>

```
size t wcsnlen(const wchar_t *s, size_t n);
```

K.3.7.4.4 The strnlen s function

Synopsis

1

```
#define __STDC_WANT_LIB_EXT1__ 1
#include <string.h>
size_t strnlen_s(const char *s, size_t maxsize);
```

Description

2 The strnlen_s function computes the length of the string pointed to by s. maximum initial segment of the array pointed to by s which is not more than maxsize characters and consists entirely of characters other than null. At most the first maxsize characters of s shall be accessed by strnlen_s. The implementation shall behave as if it reads the characters sequentially and stops as soon as a null character is found.

Returns

3 If s is a null pointer, 515) then the strnlen s function returns zero.

4 Otherwise, the <code>strnlen_s</code> function returns the number of characters that precede the terminating null character. If there is no null character in the first <code>maxsize</code> characters of <code>s</code> then <code>strnlen_s</code> returns <code>maxsize</code>. At most the first <code>maxsize</code> characters of <code>s</code> shall be accessed by <code>strnlen_s</code>.

K.3.9.2.4.1 The wcsnlen s function

Synopsis

1

```
#define __STDC_WANT_LIB_EXT1__ 1
#include <wchar.h>
size_t wcsnlen_s(const wchar_t *s, size_t maxsize);
```

Description

2 The wcsnlen_s function computes the length of the wide string pointed to by s. maximum initial segment of the array pointed to by s which is not more than maxsize wide characters and consists entirely of wide characters other than null. At most the first maxsize wide characters of s shall be accessed by wcsnlen_s. The implementation shall behave as if it reads the wide characters sequentially and stops as soon as a null wide character is found.

Returns

3 If s is a null pointer, $^{539)}$ then the wcsnlen s function returns zero.

4 Otherwise, the wcsnlen_s function returns the number of wide characters that precede the terminating null wide character. If there is no null wide character in the first maxsize wide characters of s then wcsnlen_s returns maxsize. At most the first maxsize wide characters of s shall be accessed by wcsnlen_s.

Rationale for wording

The current wording for the strnlen_s and wcsnlen_s functions is consistent with that for strlen and wcslen. In one respect it is *too* consistent: the descriptions of the bounded and unbounded versions of each function are identical:

The strlen function computes the length of the string pointed to by s.

```
(7.26.6.4 The strlen function, ISO/IEC 9899:2023)
```

versus

The strnlen_s function computes the length of the string pointed to by s.

```
(K.3.7.4.4 The strnlen s function, ISO/IEC 9899:2023)
```

The initial version of this paper therefore inserted the word 'bounded' into the description of strnlen and wcsnlen (said to compute the length of a 'bounded string') to disambiguate them from strlen and wcslen. However, that attempted remediation was insufficient.

The standard does not define the term 'bounded string', but defines 'string' as follows:

A string is a contiguous sequence of characters terminated by and including the first null character.

```
(7.1.1 Definitions of terms, ISO/IEC 9899:2023)
```

Reading the descriptions of strnlen_s and wcsnlen_s with the above definition in mind, it appears that the term 'string' has been misused. In particular:

At most the first maxsize characters of s shall be accessed by strnlen_s.

```
(K.3.7.4.4 The strnlen s function, ISO/IEC 9899:2023)
```

Given that the number of characters accessed is limited by the value of maxsize, it follows that the input sequence of characters need not be terminated by a null character. In other words, the s parameter of $strnlen_s$ need not point to a string.

For example, MSVC v19.40 VS17.10 with /Wall translates the following program without issuing any diagnostics [11], and executing it produces the expected result (which is 3):

```
#include <string.h>
int main(void)
{
   char s[3] = {'a', 'b', 'c'};
   return strnlen_s(s, 3);
}
```

However, substituting "abc" as the initializer in the declaration of s [12] causes a diagnostic ("array is too small to include a terminating null character") to be issued:

```
#include <string.h>
int main(void)
{
   char s[3] = "abc"; // warning
   return strnlen_s(s, 3);
}
```

If such programs are valid then the s parameter of strnlen_s should instead be described as a pointer to an array, like the s2 parameter of strncat:

The strncat function appends not more than n characters (a null character and characters that follow it are not appended) from the array pointed to by s2 to the end of the string pointed to by s1.

```
(7.26.3.2 The strncat function, ISO/IEC 9899:2023)
```

Conversely, the fact that a null character might appear within the first maxsize-1 characters of the input sequence passed to strnlen_s (if maxsize is greater than zero) suggests it is valid for the number of elements in the array pointed to by s to be fewer than maxsize. If so, it would be incorrect to declare s as a variably modified parameter, s [maxsize].

For example, MSVC v19.40 VS17.10 with /Wall translates the following program without issuing any diagnostics [13], and executing it produces the expected result (which is 3):

```
#include <string.h>
int main(void)
{
    return strnlen_s("abc", 20);
}
```

However, the above program relies on implementations of strnlen_s having an undocumented property equivalent to that documented for the memchr function:

The implementation shall behave as if it reads the characters sequentially and stops as soon as a matching character is found.

(7.26.5.2 The memchr generic function, ISO/IEC 9899:2023)

"Null character" would need to be substituted for "matching character" in a revised description of strnlen s based on this wording, or in a description of any similar function.

The POSIX descriptions of strnlen [14] and wesnlen do not fall into the same trap of describing the input sequence of characters as a string, but do imply that an array might have a terminating character:

The strnlen() function shall compute the smaller of the number of bytes in the array to which s points, not including any terminating NUL character, or the value of the maxlen argument. The strnlen() function shall never examine more than maxlen bytes of the array pointed to by s.

This aspect of their descriptions has been the subject of a defect report [15].

I judged it more important for the C standard to be internally consistent than for its wording to be identical to POSIX. Consequently, my proposed descriptions of the strnlen and wcsnlen functions are based more on the ISO C descriptions of strncat and wcsncat (alternative 1) or the ISO C description of strspn (alternative 2) than the ISO C descriptions of strnlen_s and wcsnlen_s or the POSIX descriptions of strnlen and wcsnlen.

Both alternatives adapt existing wording from the ISO C description of memchr to allow strnlen and wcsnlen to be used to compute a bounded length for strings allocated from storage that would be insufficient for a string of the given maximum length.

The wording proposed for wcsnlen in alternative 1 diverges slightly from the existing description of wcsncat because "a null wide character and those that follow it" seems open to misinterpretation, since "those" is intended to mean "wide characters" but could be misunderstood as "null wide characters".

When compared to strnlen_s and wcsnlen_s, the guarantee about the maximum number of characters accessed by strnlen and wcsnlen has been moved to the main description of those functions because it does not appear to relate to their return value.

When compared to strnlen_s and wcsnlen_s, the following caveat was omitted from the description of the return value of strnlen and wcsnlen:

If s is a null pointer, then the xxxnlen function returns zero.

(K.3.7.4.4 The strnlen s function, ISO/IEC 9899:2023)

None of the implementations of strnlen that I examined implement special behaviour for a null pointer; to do so would be inconsistent with the behaviour of functions such as strlen.

When compared to strnlen_s and wcsnlen_s, the maxsize parameter of strnlen and wcsnlen was renamed as n. This matches the equivalent parameter of the strncpy and strncat functions and avoids potential confusion between a result of the sizeof operator and a character count.

This change seems compatible with the special meaning of the name n:

Where an argument declared as $size_t$ n specifies the length of the array for a function, n can have the value zero on a call to that function. Unless explicitly stated otherwise in the description of a particular function in this subclause, pointer arguments on such a call shall still have valid values, as described in 7.1.4. On such a call, a function that locates a character finds no occurrence, a function that compares two character sequences returns zero, and a function that copies characters copies zero characters.

(7.26.1 String function conventions, ISO/IEC 9899:2023)

The description of the return value of strnlen_s and wcsnlen_s specifies behaviour when s is a null pointer, because null is a valid value. I believe this means the maxsize parameter of strnlen_s and wcsnlen_s could likewise be renamed as n but left that to the committee's judgement.

The section numbering assumes that describing strlen and strnlen consecutively is desirable, and similarly that wcsnlen should be described as close as possible to wcslen. However, it also assumes that renumbering 7.31.4.7.2 "The wmemset function" is undesirable. Alternatively, 7.31.4.7.2 and the proposed 7.31.4.7.3 could be swapped so that the descriptions of wcslen and wcsnlen are consecutive. This would be more intuitive for readers.

Acknowledgements

I would like to recognize the following people for their help:

Joseph Myers, Nick Stoughton, Robert Seacord, Aaron Ballman.

References

[1] strnlen(3) — Linux manual page

https://man7.org/linux/man-pages/man3/strnlen.3.html

[2] wcsnlen(3) — Linux manual page

https://man7.org/linux/man-pages/man3/wcsnlen.3.html

[3] Blaming glibc/string/strnlen.c at master · lattera/glibc

https://github.com/lattera/glibc/blame/master/string/strnlen.c

[4] Rationale for TR 24731 — Extensions to the C Library — Part I: Bounds-checking interfaces

https://www.open-std.org/jtc1/sc22/wg14/www/docs/n1173.pdf

[5] Updated Field Experience With Annex K — Bounds Checking Interfaces

https://www.open-std.org/jtc1/sc22/wg14/www/docs/n1969.htm

[6] Annex K Repairs

https://www.open-std.org/jtc1/sc22/wg14/www/docs/n2809.pdf

[7] Programmer's Reference Manual – Format of a sprite

http://www.riscos.com/support/developers/prm/sprites.html#22649

[8] Compiler Explorer

https://godbolt.org/z/49qaPY4f5

[9] Compiler Explorer

https://godbolt.org/z/bTKEv8dhq

[10] N3054 working draft — September 3, 2022 ISO/IEC 9899:2023

https://www.open-std.org/jtc1/sc22/wg14/www/docs/n3054.pdf

[11] Compiler Explorer

https://godbolt.org/z/e1Th5h57s

[12] Compiler Explorer

https://godbolt.org/z/44na6c855

[13] Compiler Explorer

https://godbolt.org/z/fxd4nzv37

[14] strlen, strnlen - get length of fixed size string

https://pubs.opengroup.org/onlinepubs/9699919799/functions/strlen.html

[15] Austin Group Defect Tracker

https://www.austingroupbugs.net/view.php?id=1834