ISO/IEC/JTC1/SC22/WG23 N0730

Report on Meeting with SC 22/WG 21/SG12 C++ Undefined behaviour Study Group

13 July 2017-07-11

Convenor met with WG 21 at the C++ June 10-14 meeting in Toronto, Ontario.

Present at the meeting of SG 12

 Stephen Michell

 Gabby

 Bjorne

 Patrice Roy

 Michael Wong

 Aaron Ball

 reminder about the WG 23 WebEx session tomorrow at 1600 EDT/1300 PDT, 2100 UK summer time/2200 CET summer. SC22WG23.247 contains the teleconference information.

The main agenda item will be the results of my meeting with WG 21 C++ on Thursday July 13th, and where we take it from there.

Before I met with WG 21 on Thursday, Michael Wong and others convinced the WG 21 leadership to add “Vulnerabilities” to the title of SG 12, which is looking at undefined behaviours. Therefore, on Thursday, I met with SG 12 and we discussed where WG 23 is and how we can work together.

Present in the meeting were myself, Patrice, Aaron Ballman, Gabby, Michael, Bjorne, and about 3 others.

SG 12 basically agreed that WG 21 needs to do something about vulnerabilities. They seemed fairly happy about our proposed approach to leave the vulnerabilities in the C subset as documented in TR 24772-3, with some appropriate wording connecting them.

I surprised them when I pointed out that Ada, widely acknowledged to be a “safe” language, acknowledges 50 of the 63 language-defined vulnerabilities. I think that they realized at that point that we want to work with them and not work to make C++ look bad.

They expressed concern about taking a MISRA C or MISRA C++ approach to using vulnerabilities to define subsets. I think that I convinced them that we were not specifying subsets or what language features to avoid, simply pointing out how vulnerabilities occur and giving guidance.

Bjorne suggested that the TR should reference the Core guidelines that he and others are developing. We also agreed that the core guidelines should reference this document as they give guidance.

We have agreed that WG 23 will meet with WG 21/SG 12 for 2 days in October 2017 in Albuquerque, NM the week of 16-20 Oct (I believe). We should make plans for attendance at that meeting, although I will have WebEx running.