

# Removal of Bullet 67 in Appendix J.2

Document No: N2201

Date: 2018-02-08

Roberto Bagnara (bagnara@cs.unipr.it)  
BUGSENG and University of Parma, Italy  
Member, MISRA C Working Group

Andrew Banks (andrew@andrewbanks.com)  
Frazer-Nash Research  
Chairman, MISRA C Working Group

## Abstract

Bullet 67 in Appendix J.2 has the following text:

*Two qualified types that are required to be compatible do not have the identically qualified version of a compatible type (6.7.3).*

After extensive search it was found that this bullet is redundant and was probably added by mistake.

## Amplification

Over the years, several people in the MISRA C working group have tried hard to understand what bullet 67 is for. This effort goes back to (at least) the publication of C99, where what is now bullet 67 was bullet 64. Recently this effort has been resumed and a systematic scan of the C11 document was made, which confirmed that bullet 67 is redundant. It seems likely that who compiled that portion of Appendix J.2 did a linear scan of 6.7.3:

- ...
- Bullet 66 was added to cover 6.7.3#9;
- Bullet 67 was added to cover 6.7.3#10.

But 6.7.3#10 does not introduce an undefined behavior, it simply explains the role of qualifiers in the notion of type compatibility.

A message was sent by Roberto Bagnara to the reflector on January 6th, 2018. Jens Gustedt and Martin Sebor participated to the discussion and agreed that they could not find an undefined behavior covered by bullet 67 that was not already covered by a more specific bullet in Appendix J.2.

## Proposed Resolution

Remove bullet 67 from Appendix J.2.