



doc. nr. ISO/IEC JTC 1/SGFS N 737	
date 1992-12-14	total pages
item nr.	supersedes document

Secretariat: Nederlands Normalisatie-instituut (NNI)
Kalijeslaan 2 P.O. box 5059
2600 GB Delft
Netherlands
telephone: + 31 15 690390
telefax: + 31 15 690180
telex: 38144 nni nl
telegrams: Normalisatie Delft

ISO/IEC JTC 1/SGFS
Title: ISO/IEC JTC 1 Special Group on Functional
Standardization

Secretariat: NNI (Netherlands)

Title : AFNOR comments on 2WDTR 10000-1.3
Source : AFNOR
Status : Discussed during the SGFS Authorized Subgroup Meeting,
December 1992, London
Note :

COMMENT ON SECOND WORKING DRAFT OF ISO/IEC TR 10000-1.3
--

Source: AFNOR

version 3 - 04/12/1992

COMMENT: -1- DEFINITION OF FUNCTIONAL PROFILE
QUALIFIER: M
SECTION: 3.1.3

RATIONALE:

The term component in the definition may be misleading. It is understood in different ways by different persons. It is not necessary to introduce this term in the definition.

A function is some time understood as a technical function (e.g TA51) and some time in a user oriented meaning (e.g accounting). Function is used as "technical function" in the definition. in the other case, the word "usage" is proposed.

PROPOSAL:

replace the definition by the following:

"3.1.3 Functional Profile: A profile defining a technical function which is an identifiable element of the Open System Environment."

COMMENT: -2- DEFINITION OF GENERIC PROFILE
QUALIFIER: M
SECTION: 3.1.4

RATIONALE:

The definition proposed in 3.1.4 is only a distinction to industry profiles. The Generic profiles are mainly a different approach than functional profiles. While functional profiles define one technical function (with one or some base standards), a generic profile defines a set of usages of an open system environment.

Note: The concept of usage is a result of the compilation of user requirements (including other TCs). The definition of "usage" needs further development.

There is an unbounded set of technical functions which leads to a large number of functional profiles (the number must be kept as small as possible).

While there is an unbounded set of usages, it is possible to group several usages together in one generic environment (e.g a desktop environment). This leaves the possibility to keep the taxonomy of generic profiles short.

In a second step, a generic profile will be implemented as a group of technical functions.

PROPOSAL:

replace section 3.1.4 by the following

"3.1.4 Generic Profile: A profile defining a coherent set of usages not specific to a particular community of use. An example can be a desktop environment.

The number of generic profiles should remain small in order to facilitate the procurement".

COMMENT: -3- **DEFINITION OF INDUSTRY PROFILE**
QUALIFIER: **M**
SECTION: **3.1.4**

RATIONALE:

An industry sector or even a user company may decide to select some generic environments and to add some new functions (functional profiles or some additional specific functions needed). It is even possible to define new environments adapted to a specific need (e.g. a robotic environment for painting cars). This set of environments may be described as an industry specific profile (or a company profile).

A good example is given by the profile defined by POSC (Petroleum Open Software Corporation). Such industry profiles may be defined by other TCs (e.g. TC184, TC68...)

The framework described in this new version of TR 10000-1 clearly shows than this kind of industry specific profile should refer to generic profiles for the information technology part of the profile. This will avoid to have banking environment not able to communicate with petrol environment...

PROPOSAL:

ADD after section 3.1.4 a new section:

"3.1.X Industry Specific Profile: A profile defining the requirements of a specific industry sector. The implementation of the industry specific profile is specified in term of Generic environments and additional constraints".

COMMENT: -4- **DEFINITION OF AEP**
QUALIFIER: **M**
SECTION: **3.1.9**

RATIONALE:

The concept of AEP is misleading as it is understood in different ways by different groups:

- In section 3.1.9 it is described as an environment profile (Generic or industry specific)
- In POSC, AEP means a profile for a specific industry
- In IEEE P1003.0, AEP is described by the functionalities. While the set of functions may be complete and then lead to a complete environment such as a Generic Profile, the approach is slightly different (a set of technical functions versus a set of usages involving selected functions)

Application Environment Profiles doesn't add a new concept. To keep TR 10000-1 understandable by the various communities involved in profiles (users, suppliers, standards bodies), it is better to avoid proliferation of different profiles (already 3 are described...).

PROPOSAL:

DELETE section 3.1.9,
and change AEP by the adequate term in the document.

COMMENT: -5- **CALL FOR STUDIES**
QUALIFIER: **M**
SECTION: **General**
RATIONALE:

The Framework described in TR 10000-1 shows the different aspects of OSE. Each of them leads to several additional processes which may be required in defining OSE profiles. Those processes and additions should be internationally agreed upon.

PROPOSAL:

Investigate aspects in OSE where further work is required. Here is a list of potential areas for such work. This doesn't imply that AFNOR endorses those works.

- Framework for User Requirement
- Standard Info Base
- Methodology for Publicly Available Specification
- Framework for Technical Specifications
- Framework for Technology Integration
- Attributes
- Methodology (TR 10000-1 currently extended to OSE, proposal from EWO EG-OSE)

COMMENT: -6- **PORTABILITY OF DATAS**

QUALIFIER: **m**

SECTION: **1 page 1 line 35**

RATIONALE:

TSG-1 report defines 4 kinds of portability:

Program portability, data portability, people portability and interoperability.

Definition of an Open System Environment in page 5 stresses these 4 aspects.

The text in the scope doesn't say anything about data portability.

PROPOSAL:

REPLACE "and which facilitate the movement of applications and users..."

BY: "and which facilitate the movement of applications, datas and users..."