



doc. nr.	ISO/IEC JTC 1/SGFS N 517	
date	1992-04-06	total pages
item nr.		supersedes document

Secretariat: Nederlands Normalisatie-instituut (NNI)
Kalfjeslaan 2 P.O. box 5059
2600 GB Delft
Netherlands

telephone: + 31 15 690 390
telefax: + 31 15 690 190
telex: 38144 nni nl
telegrams: Normalisatie Delft

ISO/IEC JTC 1/SGFS
Title: ISO/IEC JTC 1 Special Group on Functional
Standardization

Secretariat: NNI (Netherlands)

Title : German comments on WDTR 10000-1.3 (SGFS N442)

Source : DIN

Status : For discussion during the SGFS Plenary Meeting,
June 15-19, Washington D.C., USA

Note :

Subject: German comments on WDTR 10000-1.3 (SGFS N 442)

Source: Germany

The following comments are submitted by DIN:

1. Section / Page: Scope / 3,4

The examples of other areas to which the concept may be extended should be changed as follows:

delete: "Open Distributed Processing";
add: "Portable Operating System Interface for Computer Environments (POSIX)"

Rationale: References to ODP are premature considering the status of the standards activity.

2. Section / Page: Normative References / 4

References to IEEE 1003.3 (addressing conformity concepts in the Open Systems environment) should be made. It would be useful if this IEEE document could be made available to ISO/IEC SGFS.

3. Section / Page: 3.2 Terms defined in 9646-1 / 5
Section / Page: 6 Concept of a Profile / 7 (Ed. Note)

The conformance testing concepts and terminology HAVE TO BE generalized and expanded to cover OSE, including OSI. An option to consider is to move OSI-specific terminology to TR 10000-2.

Existing conformity concepts and terminology for new areas beyond OSI protocol standards, eg for ODA and AEP have to be taken into account.

Rationale: the scope of 9646-1 is limited to OSI protocols. Already for ODA other concepts apply. For example the ODA base standard ISO 8613 does not contain a PICS. For ODA the emphasis is on conformance of an ODA data stream rather than on conformance with a protocol. ISO 8613, together with TR 10183 and the ISPs define for example in ISP 11181-2 the concept of Implementation Support Requirements (ISRs) and the following related new terms:

Generating and Receiving Support Statement (GSS/RSS):
This is considered analogous to the PICS for an ISP (that is, ISPICS);
Generating and Receiving Support Statement (GSS/RSS) Proforma:
This is considered analogous to the IPRL for an ISP.

It is assumed that IEEE 1003.3 is a source for further elements.

4. Section / Page: 6.3.1 General principles / 9, Lines 30 and 40

a) substitute "between" by "within"; the sentence then reads: "A Profile makes explicit the relationships within a set of base standards ...".

b) add "to facilitate" in clause a) that it reads as follows: "... for example to facilitate interworking between systems, or porting an application between systems...".

Rationale: Profiles alone do not achieve the objectives interoperability and/or portability.

5. Section / Page: 6.3.2 OSI Profiles / 11

Substitute section numbering "6.3.2" by "6.4.2"

Rationale: Profiles alone do not achieve the objectives interoperability and/or portability.

6. Section / Page: 6.4.1 General / 11
Section / Page: 6.6; 6.7 Static & Dynamic Conformance / 12-13

The concept of Static and Dynamic Conformance requirements as it is described only applies to OSI (protocol) profiles.

Sections 6.6 and 6.7 should be moved below section 6.3.2 (6.4.2) "OSI Profiles", or alternatively should be generalized.

Furthermore it would be worthwhile to explain clearly the difference between static and dynamic conformance requirements.

