



doc. nr.	ISO/IEC JTC 1/SGFS N 694	
date	1992-10-27	total pages
item nr.		supersedes document

Secretariat: Nederlands Normalisatie-Instituut (NNI)
Kalffjeslaan 2 P.O. box 5059
2600 GB Delft
Netherlands

telephone: + 31 15 890 390
telefax: + 31 15 890 190
telex: 38144 nni nl
telegrams: Normalisatie Delft

ISO/IEC JTC 1/SGFS
Title: ISO/IEC JTC 1 Special Group on Functional
Standardization

Secretariat: NNI (Netherlands)

Title : US Contribution on SGFS N603: Handling of Defect Reports
in a Consistent Manner in ISP Documents

Source : U.S.A.

Status : US Contribution

Note :

Source: U.S.A.

Status: U.S. National Body Response

Reference: ISO/IEC JTC1/SGFS N 603, Handling of defect reports in a consistent manner in ISP documents; and
ISO/IEC JTC1/SGFS N 626 - Resolution 4

Subject: U.S. Comments

The U. S. National Body submits the following comments on SGFS N 603 (Handling of Defect Reports in a Consistent Manner):

- We agree with the recommendations in N603 that
 - the status of all amendments and technical corrigenda should be specified in the ISP
 - this information should be provided for "original" ISPs as well as for amended ISPs
 - it is beneficial to agree on common wording to be used for this status indication.However, we have the following specific comments on implementation of these recommendations.
- The proposal in N603 states (paragraph 3) that it is more useful to have the status information in the ISP than in the Explanatory Report. However, it is unclear whether or not this proposes to delete such information from the Explanatory Report. We believe that this information should be retained in the Explanatory Report, because it is useful as part of the "Base Standards Referenced" (see SGFS N601, Clause 4.2, item b)4)) material of that report.
- Under the assumption that the status information will be contained in both the Explanatory Report and the ISP, our review indicates that the following document changes will be needed to reflect N603:

- **SGFS N601 (SD-1), SGFS Procedures**

1. Clause 4.2 b) 4): Replace by the following:

For each approved amendment and technical corrigenda to the base standards referenced in the profile, an indication of the status of that amendment or technical corrigenda. The status will be one of: included in the ISP; excluded from the ISP; or, thought to be not applicable to the ISP. This information is also included in the ISP: therefore, if the Explanatory Report and ISP are submitted at the same time, the Explanatory Report may simply refer to the ISP for this information.

(Temporary Note: This final sentence accounts for the situation described in N601, 4.1, paragraph 4, which states that the Explanatory Report may be submitted in advance of the pdISP. In that case, a reference would not be suitable.)

2. Clause 5.3: Add to the list of review actions:

x) Review the list of amendments and technical corrigenda for completeness, and for proper indication of status according to 4.2 b) 4). One part of this information is found in the "Normative References" clause of the ISP, and the remainder is found in the "Informative References to Amendments and Technical Corrigenda" clause.

(Temporary Note: Refer to comment 4 of the section on TR 10000-1 for the proposal of this clause.)

3. Clause 7.2, paragraph 2: Change "monitor publication of amendments" to "monitor publication of amendments and technical corrigenda", line 1. Change "applicability of base standard amendments" to "applicability of base standard amendments and technical corrigenda", line 4. Replace the final sentence by:

In any amendment to an ISP, a clear indication shall be given of the status of all amendments and technical corrigenda to the base standards referenced in the profile. The status will be one of: included in the ISP; excluded from the ISP; or, thought to be not applicable to the ISP. This information shall be provided according to ISO/IEC TR 10000-1, clauses 6.3.2, A.4.3, and A.6.1.

Change "amendments" to "amendments and technical corrigenda" in line 1 of the NOTE following paragraph 2.

4. Clause 7.4: Change "amendments to the base standards" to "amendments and technical corrigenda to the base standards", line 4. Add "according to TR 10000-1, clauses 6.3.2, A.4.3, and A.6.1" to the end of the final sentence.

- **TR 10000-1, Framework** (Note: WDTR 10000-1.3, SGFS N442, was used as the reference document for these comments.)

The formatting for International Standards and for International Standardized Profiles calls for documenting normative references in a specific clause titled "Normative References". No informative references shall be included in that clause. Informative references are to be documented in an informative annex. (Refer to TR 10000-1, clause A.4.3, first paragraph and final two paragraphs.)

Therefore, our proposed changes deal with those types of amendments and technical corrigenda separately.

1. Clause 6.3.2, add new item c-bis):

c-bis) informative reference to any amendments or technical corrigenda to the base standards referenced in this profile, which have been determined to be excluded or not applicable to the profile;

2. Annex A.4.3, paragraph 1: In the sentence beginning "Where published amendments ...", change "potential impact on interworking," to "potential impact on interworking, and are therefore included in the profile,".

(Temporary Note: Note that it is not necessary to attach text to the reference for each amendment and technical corrigenda which is used normatively, as proposed in N603: inclusion of the amendment or technical corrigenda in the Normative References clause already implies that information.)

3. Annex A.5.3, paragraph 1: Change "main base standards" to "base standards" in line 2. (What is a "main" base standard?) Add to the end of this first sentence, "as well as base standard amendments and technical corrigenda which are included in the definition of the profile".

4. Annex A.6.1: Add new paragraph between existing paragraphs 2 and 3, as follows:

Published amendments or technical corrigenda to the base standards referenced in this profile which have been determined to be either excluded from the profile, or not applicable to the profile, shall be explicitly referenced here, in a clause titled "Informative References to Amendments and Technical Corrigenda". This clause shall list all such documents, indicating their status, with one list for each status. These lists shall be introduced by the following wording:

The following documents contain amendments or technical corrigenda to a base standard, or part of a base standard, referenced in this International Standardized Profile. These amendments and technical corrigenda are specifically excluded from the definition of this International Standardized Profile.

The following documents contain amendments or technical corrigenda to a base standard, or part of a base standard, referenced in this International Standardized Profile. These amendments and technical corrigenda are not applicable to the definition of this International Standardized Profile.

(Temporary Note: We have proposed using common text to introduce the amendment and technical corrigenda references, as opposed to attaching common text to the individual references, as suggested in N603.)

