



InterNational Committee for Information Technology Standards (INCITS)
Secretariat: Information Technology Industry Council (ITI)
1101 K Street NW, Suite 610, Washington, DC 20005
www.INCITS.org



PL22.16 2017-11 Albuquerque Minutes

ISO/IEC JTC1 SC22 WG21 N4710 – 2017-11-26

Jonathan Wakely, jwakely@redhat.com

November 6 - 12, 2017 - Albuquerque, NM, USA

Chair: John Spicer

Opening activities (Monday 9:00)

1. Opening comments, welcome from host

Spicer thanked Nelson for serving as the previous chair.

2. Meeting guidelines

Every participant is responsible for understanding and abiding by the [INCITS Antitrust Guidelines](#) and [Patent Policy](#) and the [ISO Code of Conduct](#).

3. Membership, voting rights, and procedures for the meeting

The chair requested that prospective PL22.16 members inform the chair (Spicer) or vice-chair (Finkel) that they are present.

- **3.1 US Participants attending their first meeting.**

Ocient (Nevin Liber)

- **3.2 PL22.16 Members attaining voting rights at this meeting.**

Amazon (present)

Linden Research (present)

Oak Ridge National Laboratory (present)

- **3.3 PL22.16 Members whose membership will change from 'Voting' to 'Advisory' if absent**

SEI/CMU/CERT Coordination Center (absent)
KCG Holdings (if absent)

- **3.4 PL22.16 Members who will be in jeopardy of losing their Voting membership status by missing this meeting.**

Cisco Systems (absent)
Embarcadero Technologies (absent)
Lawrence Berkeley National Laboratory (absent)
Oracle (absent)
Symantec (absent)
University of Akron (absent)

4. Agenda review and approval

Agenda is in a revision of N4693, posted on the wiki.

Clow moved to adopt the agenda, Hedquist seconded. Approved by unanimous consent.

5. Approval of the minutes of the previous meetings

Meeting	Minutes
WG21 Toronto	N4691
PL22.16 Toronto	N4692
WG21 pre-Albuquerque administrative telecon	N4705

Ballman moved to accept the PL22.16 Toronto minutes, Hedquist seconded. Approved by unanimous consent.

Monday Afternoon - Friday Afternoon: WG21 sessions

The WG and SG chairs must arrange for any proposals to be written up in the form of a motion, and made available by 8:00 PM Friday.

Review of the meeting (Saturday 8:30 AM)

WG and SG status and progress reports. Presentation and discussion of proposals to be considered for consensus adoption by full WG21.

Closing activities

Thanked the hosts.

Thanked the convener, the officers, the editor and editors, and chairs of subgroups and study groups, the scribes, the authors and reviewers, and the people who pay for our participation, and our loved ones who make do without us.

Josuttis thanked all the participants for a constructive meeting.

PL22.16 motions, if any

None.

Issues delayed until today

None.

Plans for the future (PL22.16)

Sutter presented a proposed schedule for the C++20 IS, including moving forward the deadline for EWG to consider changes that would require the standard library to react.

Sutter asked if there was unanimous consent to accept the proposed schedule. Dennett suggested waiting because there hadn't been any time to consider it.

Next and following meetings

- 2018-07-03/12: Jacksonville, FL, US ([N4677](#))
- 2018-06-04/09: Rapperswil, CH ([N4673](#))

Other meetings not finalized.

Mailings

Upcoming mailing deadlines:

- 2017-11-27: Post-Albuquerque
- 2018-02-12: Pre-Jacksonville

Deadline for papers is 14:00 UTC.

There are plans to support self-service for automated paper number assignment.

Adjournment (11:30 AM)

Clow moved to adjourn, Hedquist seconded. Approved unanimously.

Attendance

The column "P/A" designates PL22.16 Primary, Alternate or Emeritus status.

The column "PL22.16" indicates organizations eligible to vote by "V", and advisory membership by "A".

PL22.16 members

Company / Organization	NB	Representative	P/A	PL22.16
Amazon		Louis Dionne	P	V
Amazon		John McFarlane	A	
AMD		Siu Chi Chan	A	
Apple		Duncan Exon Smith	A	V
Apple	CA	JF Bastien	A	
Apple		Tim Northover	A	
Apple		Bruno Cardoso Lopes	A	
Argonne National Lab		Hal Finkel	P	V
Bloomberg	UK	Alisdair Meredith	A	
Bloomberg	UK	Dietmar Kühl	A	
Bloomberg		David Sankel	A	
Bloomberg		David Stone	A	
Bloomberg		Frank Birbacher		
Brown		Walter E. Brown	E	
Dinkumware		P.J. Plauger	P	V
Edison Design Group		John H. Spicer	P	V
Edison Design Group		Daveed Vandevoorde	A	
Edison Design Group		Jens Maurer	A	
Edison Design Group		Mike Herrick	A	
Edison Design Group		William M. Miller	A	
EPAM Systems Inc		Mateusz Pusz	P	V
Facebook		Eric Niebler	A	
Facebook		Nathan Sidwell		
FlightSafety International		Billy Baker	P	V
Google		Chandler Carruth	A	
Google		Geoffrey Romer	A	
Google		James Dennett	A	
Google		Jeffrey Yasskin	A	
Google	UK	Richard Smith	A	
Google		Thomas Koeppe		

Company / Organization	NB	Representative	P/A	PL22.16
Google		Titus Winters	A	
Google		Chris Mysen		
Google		Tim Shen		
Google		Andrew Hunter		
Google		Matt Calabrese		
GammaTech Inc,		Aaron Ballman	P	V
GreenWireSoft		Juan Alday	P	V
IBM		Paul E. McKenney	P	V
IBM	CA	Hubert Tong	A	
Intel		Clark Nelson	P	V
Intel		Pablo Halpern	A	
Intel		Erich Keane		
Lawrence Livermore		James Frederick Reus	P	V
Lawrence Livermore		Christopher Earl		
Lawrence Livermore		Tom Scogland		
Linden Research, Inc.		Nat Goodspeed	P	V
Los Alamos National Laboratory		Li-Ta Lo	P	V
Los Alamos National Laboratory		S. Davis Herring	A	
Los Alamos National Laboratory		Rachel Ertl	A	
Louisiana State University		Hartmut Kaiser	P	V
Louisiana State University		Agustin Berge	A	
LTK Engineering		Alan Talbot	P	V
Microsoft		Gabriel Dos Reis	A	V
Microsoft		Herb Sutter	A	
Microsoft		Stephan T. Lavavej	A	
Microsoft		Gor Nishanov	A	
Microsoft		Andrew Pardoe	A	
Microsoft		Casey Carter	A	
Microsoft		Andrew Marino	A	
MongoDB		Adam Martin	P	V
NVidia		Jared Hoberock	A	V
NVidia		Michael Garland	A	
NVidia		Olivier Giroux	A	
NVidia		Bryce Adelstein-Lelbach		
Oak Ridge National Laboratory		Graham Lopez	P	V
Ocient		Nevin Liber	P	
Perennial		Barry Hedquist	P	V
Perennial		Beman G. Dawes	A	
Plum Hall	FI	Ville Voutilainen	A	V

Company / Organization	NB	Representative	P/A	PL22.16
Programming Research Group		Christof Meerwald	A	
Qualcomm		Marshall Clow	P	V
Red Hat	UK	Jonathan Wakely	A	V
Red Hat		Torvald Riegel	A	
Ripple Labs		Howard E. Hinnant	P	V
Ripple Labs		Scott Schurr	A	
Sandia National Labs		Carter Edwards	P	V
Sandia National Labs		David Hollman		
Sandia National Labs		Mark Hoemmen		
Sandia National Labs		Dan Sunderland		
Schonfeld Tools LLC		Wesley Maness	P	V
Seymour		Bill Seymour	P	V
Sony Computer Entertainment		Michael Spencer	A	V
Stellar Science		Kelly Walker	P	V
Stellar Science		Michael William Buksas	A	
Stellar Science		Daniel Davis	A	
Synopsis		Tom Honermann	A	

Participating non-members

Company / Organization	NB	Representative
BDS	BG	Vasil Vasilev
Codeplay	CA	Michael Wong
Mozilla	CA	Botond Ballo
University of Windsor	CA	Paul Preney
Vollmann Engineering	CH	Detlef Vollmann
HSR	CH	Peter Sommerlad
self	CH	Mauro Bianco
GSI	DE	Matthias Kretz
University Carlos III	ES	J. Daniel García
Yandex	RU	Aleksandr Fokin
self	UK	Dinka Ranns
PDT Partners	UK	Jeff Snyder
self	UK	Jonathan Coe
self	UK	Roger Orr
Jetbrains	UK	Timur Doumler
Nokia	PL	Michał Dominiak
Jump Trading		Barry Revzin
National Instruments		Ben Craig

Company / Organization	NB	Representative
KEWB Computing		Bob Steagall
self		Faisal Vali
Blizzard		James Touton
University of Nice		Jean-Paul Rigault
Crystal Clear Software		Jeff Garland
Tanium		Lisa Lippincott
VMWare		Mark Zeren
self		Michael Park
Bob Taco Industries		Michael McLaughlin
self		Michael Young
self		Nicolai Josuttis
Roundhouse Consulting		Pete Becker
RKR Capital		Robert Douglas
Sabre		Tomasz Kamiński
ARM		Will Deacon
Cadence		Zach Laine
MJD Interactive		Brigham Toskin
QwidgetCo		Fred Moxley
DXC		Michael Scoggin
self		Nathan Myers