Voting Summary on JTC 1/SC 34 N 185
Preliminary working draft for Topic Map Conceptual Model

P-Member	APPROVAL OF THE DRAFT AS PRESENTED	APPROVAL OF THE DRAFT WITH COMMENTS AS GIVEN ON THE ATTACHED	DISAPPROVAL OF THE DRAFT FOR REASONS ON THE ATTACHED	Acceptance of these reasons and appropriate changes in the text will change our vote to approval	ABSTENTION (FOR REASONS BELOW):
Brazil					
Canada					
China	X				
Denmark	X				
France					
Ireland	X				
Italy					
Japan		X (technical and editorial)			
Republic of Korea					
Netherlands					
Norway	X				
United Kingdom			X		
United States		X (technical)			

SC 34 NATIONAL BODY COMMENTS ON SC 34 N 185

JAPAN

(1) Notation of the diagrams

Create a new clause of "Reference", where the document of Unified Modelling Language should be specified.

The TM conceptual model specific notation, e.g., "+", should be defined.

(2) The 5th Figure

The line from "Addressable Subject" to "Subject" should be a Line ending in hollow triangle: from subtype to type.

(3) Clause "Association Templates define classes of Association"

An Association Template for marriage, for example, may have two Roles, 'may-be-husband', played the class of men, and 'may-be-husband', played the class of women.

should be

An Association Template for marriage, for example, may have two Roles, 'may-be-husband', played the class of men, and 'may-be-wife', played the class of women.

(4) Clause "Topic Occurrences are Associations between Topics and Resources"

The TopicRole may be played by any Topic at all, but the OccurrenceRole must be played by a Topic whose Subect is a Resource.

should be

The TopicRole may be played by any Topic at all, but the OccurrenceRole must be played by a Topic whose Subject is a Resource.

(5) Top headline "XML Topic Maps, Introduction"

It should be "Introduction to Topic Maps" rather than "Introduction to XML Topic Maps".

"Topic Map Conceptual Model" should be dealt with before describing "XTM Conceptual Model".

(6) The 9th Figure

The arrow from "Class" to "Topic" should be the arrow from "Topic" to "Class".

UNITED KINGDOM

These comments are attached to the ballot form for SC 34 N 0185
Reason for disapproval:

'The UK cannot approve SC 34N 185 as a PDTR because the text is incomplete and it
contains details that are not widely agreed in the international community. The UK considers
that the text will probably need revision and addition to accommodate the needs of a wider

community. The UK is willing to contribute to the necessary debate to help progress this Technical Report. The UK endorses the nomination of Mr D Rivers-Moore as a potential Project Editor.'

UNITED STATES

Needs to be coordinated with the TM Conceptual Model. Also needs to be founded on the TM Processing Model (which should be forthcoming from the ISO/IEC 13250 editors).