ISO/IEC JTC1/SGFS N610 (TD:W/34)

TITLE: References to Technical Reports by ISPs

SOURCE: ISO/IEC JTC1/SGFS

DATE: June 1992

STATUS: For action by Editor TR 10000-1

Proposal to change TR 10000-1.2

In N466, the US proposed (comment #3) that "Technical Report" should be deleted from clause 3.1.5 (the definition of "Base Standard"). This comment was emphasised in N502, which proposed that JTC1 be asked to rule on the status of TRs, particularly regarding the degree of consensus which attaches to them. In TR 10000-1.3, following a similar discussion at the Authorised Subgroup Meeting of SGFS in October 1991, the Base Standard definition (now 3.1.3) was changed to remove "Technical Report", and a consequential change was made to clause 6.1, to reflect the need for TRs to be referenced from ISPs under appropriate circumstances.

After discussion in the SGFS, the conclusion was reached that the TR 10000-1.3 solution to these concerns should be adopted, with a more extensive set of words to identify what circumstances were "appropriate". The Editor of TR 10000-1 is instructed to make such a change in the process of resolving ballot comments. (See N626, Resolution 11).

The first three of the criteria given below should be checked in the process of reviewing PDISPs.

Similar words will be used in the next revision of TR 10000-1.3

The US would still like the issue in N502 to be raised in JTC1, though it will have to be done at an appropriate point in the agenda. It is believed that there are other moves in JTC1 to review the status of Technical Reports, which may mean that such an occasion will arise.

Proposed text for TR 10000-1.2 6.1. After the fourth paragraph insert:

In exceptional circumstances, described below, normative reference may be made to Technical Reports. Such reference, which requires that the following conditions are met, shall be justified on a case-by-case basis.

No base standard addressing the requirements is available, but a Technical Report is.

The use is identified and discussed in the Explanatory Report, justifying that use.

The JTC-1 body responsible for that Technical Report agrees that a normative reference is an appropriate use of that Technical Report,

the National Bodies approve this usage in the DISP ballot process.