

Subject: Issues List for future development of ISO/IEC TR 10000-1
Source: Editor - ISO/IEC TR 10000-1.2 (Mr. R.V.S.Lloyd)
Date: November 1991

This is a progression of document SGFS N230 with respect to outstanding issues for the development of TR 10000-1. It reflects the output of the Berlin meeting of SGFS in June 1991, and the subsequent proposed draft of TR 10000-1.2 in N430.

It comprises commentary on the existing issues listed in N230, indication of the current status of those items, and whether or not they remain valid in the light of the draft revision of TR 10000-1. Additional items raised but not resolved in June 1991 have been added.

It is likely that relevant items on the Issues List raised at the October 1991 Authorised Sub-group meeting in Brussels will transfer to this list once confirmation of the progression to TR 10000-1.3 is agreed.

Note that N230 contained empty sections (contents "to be supplied") regarding the progression of TR 10000-2 and N201. These sections have not been retained in this document, which now relates only to the development of Part 1 of TR 10000.

Items transferred from SGFS N230

Item 1 Distinction between base standards and ISP and/or acceptance of standards as profiles.

N181 Canada comments, P2.

See item 8 below, since this text in N181 relates to Application contexts.

N148 UK comments, editorial 5

All comments were successfully resolved in editing the text of TR 10000-1 : 1990.

N156 PAGODA

This text relates to the addition of ODA profile methodology to TR 10000-1, - see item 9 below.

As there are no remaining identified problems, this issue is CLOSED.

Item 2 Protocol profile testing methodology

N179 SC21 liaison statement

Superseded by later developments:

N213 Confirms that SC21 WG1 will address this subject in ISO/IEC 9646.

N233 Confirms that SGFS accepts this.

N435 (SC21 N6191) indicates that when ISO/IEC 9646-6 reaches DIS status in 1992, amendments will be needed to remove material on profile conformance from TR 10000. S-liaisons with SC21 WG1 will contribute directly to the development of ISO/IEC 9646.

Query: Should only protocol profiles be considered?

N349 indicates that TR 10183 covers implementation testing methodology for ODA Profiles, and TR 10000-1.2 refers to this.

Testing methodology for other classes of F-profile and for R-profiles has not yet been raised in any contributions to SGFS.

This issue remains OPEN until adequate reference to stable ISO/IEC 9646 text can be made.

Item 3 One or more taxonomies?

SGFS Plenary/Chairman

No specific document referenced; however, this is assumed to refer to the extension of TR 10000-2 taxonomy to cover profiles from outside JTC1. This is covered under item 7 below. The issue is therefore CLOSED.

Item 4 Conformance

N238 Issues raised by SC21 WG1 (ref to N213)

N288 - N292 Output documents from Nov 1990 Ad Hoc SGFS meeting.

This topic, along with items 2 and 10, is now the responsibility of SC21 WG1 and is being progressed there with the assistance of direct S-liaison activity. See N435 for current SC21 position. This will, when the associated work in ISO/IEC 9646 is stable, result in the editing of clauses 6 and 8, and the removal of Annex C from TR 10000-1. The issue therefore remains OPEN.

Item 5 Multiple ISPs

N148 FR comments, general 2

N177 DK Comments

Query: Is it a procedural problem?

This point concerns the over-elaborate use of separate parts of ISPs, especially in the context of T-profiles. A paragraph urging caution was inserted into TR 10000-1 8.2, and subsequent use of the multi-part structure in ISPs 10608 and 10609 has been accepted. This issue is therefore CLOSED.

Item 6 Complexity of profiles based on upper layer standards and relationship to the functions as defined by "service providers"

N153 EWOS

The issue described here does not appear to match any points raised in the quoted EWOS contribution. The issue is therefore CLOSED.

There was one outstanding issue in N153 recorded in N191, the disposition of comments on DTR 10000-1, but this related to the problem of writing generic statements about profiles in TR10000-1. This no longer appears to be an issue, or if it is, it will be addressed when OSI-specific material is specifically identified as such in TR 10000-1.3.

Item 7 Extension of the scope of TR 10000

Possible candidates:

- Operating systems
- Application of specific ISPs

This breaks down into two separate topics:

Item 7.1 Profiles for the Open System Environment

N337 EWOS: Extension of TR 10000 for OSE

N355 SC22 WG15: Proposal for OSE Profiles

N364 Belgian comments on the scope of TR 10000

N374 BSI support for extension of scope of TR 10000

N402 The Way Ahead

Progressed during the Authorised Sub-group meeting, October 1991. See output documents, including first working draft of TR 10000-1.3. This issue remains OPEN.

Item 7.2 ISPs not exclusively the responsibility of JTC1

N391 Liaison statement to TC 46

N392 Liaison statement to TC 184

N412 Report of SWG meeting, Geneva June 1991

Awaiting agreement of relevant TCs. Amendment of TR 10000-1 and -2 will be required and also possibly the addition of extra part(s) to TR 10000. This issue remains OPEN.

Item 8 The Applications Context issue

N233 Part C: Relation of ISPs to Application Context

In N181, Canada raised the proposal that TR 10000 should reference application-context-definitions as well as the base standards for A- and B-profiles. The June 1990 SGFS meeting in Tokyo proposed text for TR 10000-1 clause 6.3.2 in a liaison statement to SC21 WG6 for the attention of the uLA Rapporteur (N233). As far as can be seen, no response was received from SC21 on this subject (in fact, no copy of N233 can be found in the SC21 document register, so the lack of any response may be due to an administrative error somewhere), and no proposal for updating TR 10000-1 was made on this subject at Berlin, June 1991. The proposal in N233 therefore remains the current position, and the Editor of TR 10000-1 seeks advice from SGFS as to whether this text should be incorporated in TR 10000-1.2. (See Annex A for a copy of the relevant text from N233).

This issue therefore remains OPEN

Item 9 Changes to incorporate ODA

N206 Liaison statement from SC18

This text relates to the addition of ODA profile methodology to TR 10000-1, and was developed through N349; see N390 for the resulting editing instructions and N431 for additional editor's notes.

There is a remaining issue here, regarding the terminology used in the DISPs for FOD profiles (see SGFS N419 through N424). It concerns the use of the term "Document Application Profile" (DAP) which is defined in ISO/IEC 8613-1, and its relationship to the term "Profile" as defined in TR 10000-1 3.1.2. DAP is also referenced in TR 10000-1 8.3.2, in accordance with SGFS N390 editing instructions.

Taking the explanation given in N420, the review report for PDISP 10610-1, an ISP is the specification of an FODxx Profile, which may contain more than one DAP - in the case in question, two DAPs, one using ODIF encoding, and one using ODL encoding, as specified in DISP 10610-1 clause 8, and reiterated in the final paragraph of clause 1. However, the DISP has been entitled "Document Application Profile" - i.e. not indicating that it includes two DAPs - a usage which is in agreement with TR 10000-1 8.3.2. Either the DISP needs to be retitled "Document Application Profiles", and the wording of TR 10000-1 adapted, or the use of the term DAP has to be refined (in conjunction with CCITT, who are jointly responsible for ISO/IEC 8613 and the T.41x series of recommendations).

This issue therefore remains OPEN while TR10000-1.2 is being progressed.

Item 10 PICS Proforma instructions and Annex C of TR 10000-1

N214 Catalogue of PICS proforma notations

N289 Position statement on PICS proforma notations (from Nov 1990 ad hoc SGFS meeting)

superseded by later developments:

N381 (=SC21 N6160) Catalogue of PICS proforma notations.

N435 (=SC21 N6191) Liaison statement to SGFS on Profile Conformance.

This topic is now the responsibility of SC21 WG1, and is being progressed there with the assistance of direct S-liaison activity. This will, when the associated work in ISO/IEC 9646 is stable, result in the editing of clauses 6 and 8, and the removal of Annex C from TR 10000-1. The issue therefore remains OPEN.

New items added in June 1991

Item 11 Common partial profiles

N331 Upper layers

EWOS expects the S-liaisons to contribute a Common Upper Layers Requirements ISP as indicated in the referenced document. Item 4 of N390 gave editing instructions related to this for TR 10000-1. This issue remains OPEN while TR 10000-1.2 progresses, and until such a PDISP is submitted, reviewed and balloted.

N339 Lower Layers

Item 5 of N390 gave editing instructions related to this for TR 10000-1. This part of the issue is therefore CLOSED.

Item 12 Profile qualifiers and orthogonal functions

N335 EWOS request for discussion.

N393 Request to SGFS NBs and LOs for input on this subject.

This issue remains OPEN

Item 13 Registered objects

N340 EWOS proposal regarding the relationship of ISPs to Registration Authorities, specifically in the context of Virtual terminal profiles.

N396 Request to SC21, SC18 and CS/ITTF for comment.

This issue has been taken into account in the editing of TR 10000-1.2 (see N390 item 6). However, responses to N396 are awaited, and these may impact the final resolution of this point. This issue therefore remains OPEN.

Item 14 ISP text structure

N297 CCITT comments on DISPs

N389 SGFS Additional guidance to developers of ISPs

N297 was reviewed in June 1991, and three points were made in the output document N389; the third of these was included in the edit of TR 10000-1.2 according to item 9 of N390. These specific comments on ISP text having been resolved, this issue is therefore CLOSED.

Annexe

The following document, relating to an open item in this Issues List, is attached for information:

